Digital logistics: Enchantment in distribution channels

2 authors:

Benjamin Burroughs
University of Nevada, Las Vegas
30 PUBLICATIONS   **311** CITATIONS

W. Jeffrey Burroughs
Brigham Young University - Hawaii
30 PUBLICATIONS   **942** CITATIONS

Some of the authors of this publication are also working on these related projects:

Journalistic Authority View project

Civic Wounds View project

Digital logistics: Enchantment in distribution channels

Benjamin Burroughs [a,*], W. Jeffrey Burroughs [b]

[a] University of Nevada, Las Vegas (UNLV), Las Vegas, Nevada, USA
[b] Brigham Young University-Hawaii, USA

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

This article analyzes ways that logistical services add value to products over and above traditional utility tradeoffs as a result of a confluence of aesthetic, economic, and cultural facets that we identify as *enchantment*. We delve into how enchantment might be digitally articulated through mediated (as opposed to brick and mortar) consumption, paying attention to the cultural techniques and affordances of the platforms and spaces. Through a series of case studies, we examine ways in which enchantment can occur in digitally mediated shopping environments. Our case studies suggest that enchanted digital logistical channels extend the value-creating functions of traditional logistics by creating consumption circumstances that surprise and intrigue, that suggest perceived scarcity, and that use social media to approach consumers in multiple ways to procure enchantment.

Consumption choices are embedded in cultural contexts—part of which are the logistical distribution systems that facilitate such choices. In this article we identify a class of these distribution systems that add value to merchandise through presentations to customers that have been identified as *enchanted* (p. 4, [1]. Most studies explicating the role of enchantment in consumption have focused on brick and mortar distribution channels where customers directly interact with merchandise or experiences. However, many sectors now feature multi-channel retail options for consumers including mediated and digital avenues. For example, retailers may sell goods at brick and mortar stores, in outlet stores, by catalog, through company websites, or at seasonal channels such as pop-up stores. The variety of possible distribution channels experienced by consumers produces, in turn, a variety of shopping alternatives that are intrinsic parts of the consumption experience. As a result of the COVID-19 pandemic of 2020, many of these channels of distribution have been severely curtailed. Government stay-at-home orders caused a large percentage of brick and mortar stores to close, leaving many retailers with primarily digital channels to distribute their goods. These wrenching changes may have lasting impact with digital channels increasing in importance for many sectors of the economy. Given these on-going changes to distribution, we delve into how enchantment might be digitally articulated in mediated shopping situations, paying attention to the cultural techniques and affordances of the platforms and spaces, often in contrast to traditional distribution channels.

Research in consumption has often glossed over the specifics of logistical movement [2] in favor of studies of marketing processes (c.f [14,25]]. Logistics are an essential function of any B2C business. The varieties of distribution channels now available continue to create diversity in the retail environments experienced by consumers. Such experiences and the differences between them are important, with many channels enabling shopping experiences that are significant extensions of simple product selection. For example, Nordstrom has recently opened small neighborhood-based stores dubbed "*Nordstrom Local*" that have little or no clothing stock but rather are locations for customers to interact with stylists, try on clothes, and place and pickup online orders [5]. Locals also offer tailoring services and manicures in an effort to create an alternative shopping environment. Although this distribution channel's overall goal is to sell clothing, the mix of goods and services presented to customers creates a hybrid distribution channel that creates value beyond the proceeds of the sale of an item of apparel. Value in a distribution channel is therefore not determined simply by a tradeoff of the cost of merchandise versus a perceived utilitarian benefit derived from the item [6].

Theorists in this area characterize this extended dimension of the shopping experience as possessing logistical *relevance* [7]. Relevance encompasses the customization of product and service offerings from suppliers so that products and experiences are differentiated from others in the marketplace. As such it extends beyond a common definition of relevance to a theoretically rich approach that incorporates a focus on

---

* Corresponding author.
E-mail address: benjamin.burroughs@unlv.edu (B. Burroughs).

relationships, networks, and service [8]. Such unique logistical services add value by tailoring specific solutions to customer needs—making logistics relevant to customers. We first provide a brief review considering factors that drive the perceived value of goods and services within channels of distribution. We assert that a part of the relevance dimension of logistics is the result of a confluence of aesthetic, economic, and cultural facets that add value to products over and above traditional utility tradeoffs. As noted above, we identify this type of added value as *enchantment*—an experiential condition that contributes to logistical relevance. We then provide a review of studies that have used the enchantment concept to describe consumption processes. A central upshot of this work is the importance of *place* in the creation of enchantment suggesting that enchanting experiences associated with relevant logistics have principally been theorized to take place in brick and mortar distribution situations. However, given the increasing prevalence of digital distribution systems, it is critical to also examine possibilities of enchantment in digitized spaces. Through a series of case studies, we examine the circumstances under which enchantment can occur in digitally mediated shopping environments. Finally, we summarize characteristics of enchantment within mediated distribution channels.

1. Logistical relevance in distribution channels as a site of enchantment

Our study is framed within the scaffold of the perceived value of goods and experiences [37,52]. As the logistical channels that bring goods and services to consumers are strategically enchanted, an additional method of establishing value in distribution channels is established. We contextualize this process by considering factors that drive the perceived value of goods and services within channels of distribution. Beyond the contributions of traditional value chains to products, differing modes of distribution may contribute independently to the perceived value of products, thus allowing and even requiring a broad view of the value acquisition process in distribution—a view that may include the enchantment of distribution channels. In their presentation of a service-dominant logic of marketing, Lusch and his associates (c.f [11–13]. have used an ecological metaphor to conceptualize ways that various stakeholders interact as they exchange goods and services. So, for example, associated with each product will be a network of customers, dealers, original equipment manufacturers, and tiers of suppliers interacting with each other in a dynamic exchange ecology. Moreover, the advent of the Internet has reshaped value networks so that economic advantages previously held by certain stakeholders have been moved to others within the networks (c.f [14]. Logistics services—traditionally the operational processes that enable transactions between those who supply goods and services and their customers—become an integral part of the marketing process and are subsumed under such value networks.

Operating within such value networks, logistics increase the value of products for customers in three generic ways: efficiency, effectiveness, and relevance [7]. Efficiency refers to an organization's management of costs—efficient organizations offer services at costs that are acceptable to customers. Effective logistics require the successful positioning of products and services. Customers who enjoy effective logistical operations are presented with a variety of purchase opportunities that are conveniently available. Short fulfillment times for orders, in-stock availability of products, and high-quality retail service are all examples of ways that logistics can be effective. Finally, in contrast to overall costs (efficiency) and the positioning of products (effectiveness), relevant logistics (sometimes called differentiated logistics) are distribution services that are designed around the ways customers work and live. Organizations using relevant logistics solicit information about specific customer needs and then develop solutions based on those identified needs. For example, when an integrated service provider customizes a mass mailing to meet a customer's specific scheduling requirements,

when a manufacturer integrates a particular array of electronic features into a product in order to achieve the functionality a customer requires, or even when a particular fabric is selected for an article of clothing so that it will be fashionable, the logistics involved create value because the service rendered is relevant to customers. It is necessary to develop ongoing relationships with customers to address their needs and requirements [7].

Relevancy allows logistical processes to be recruited to contribute to a product's value network beyond internal operating excellence (efficiency) or customer convenience (effectiveness). An additional way that distribution channels may become relevant is through the process of enchantment that engages consumers in what has traditionally been a mundane facet of the consumption process. Beyond gathering information to increase the desirability of product offerings, enchantment creates logistical relevance by operating on the physical and social transition points between organizations and customers, making these points of transition intriguing and enticing.

2. Enchanting consumption

Conceptualizing producer-customer exchanges as enchanted or disenchanted historically stems from Weber's [15] description of the introduction of rationalism into economic and administrative realms. In his analysis, pre-modern life was mediated by magic and mystery; the advent of modernity led to systematic increases in formal rationality, supplanting a mystical, enchanted worldview and evolving into a more systematically organized secular society. Campbell [16] provides an alternative analysis that admits a re-enchantment of rationalized systems of consumption motivated by self-illusory hedonism. According to Campbell, we consume goods not simply for utilitarian reasons but also to fulfill our consumerist daydreams—yearnings that make the process of consuming an enchanting experience. When reality fails to measure up to our daydreams, we are disappointed but inevitably re-enter the market in further search of satisfaction. The cycle repeats itself endlessly as our needs to re-experience yearning generate new desires.

Weber [15] sees the process of disenchantment as an irreversible state of modernity while Campbell [16] views the possibility of re-enchantment as essentially a product of potential consumer's imaginations. In building on Campbell's approach, Ritzer [1] argued that although re-enchantment may ultimately be futile in searching for meaning in consumption practices, re-enchantment nonetheless serves as an offset to highly rationalized and controlling marketing practices. More recently, post-modern thinkers have seen the processes of disenchantment and re-enchantment as sociohistoric constructions that are in a process of continual "fruitful tension" [17]; p. 700) where combinations of rationalizing and enchanting elements are present simultaneously.

A clarifying example of the enchanting power of such a fruitful tension is presented by Thompson and Coskuner-Balli [18] who use a formulation of enchantment to account for reasons why consumers are willing to support farms that practice community supported agriculture. Such farms typically sell produce by subscription in a commune format—delivering some rather arbitrary selection of organic produce (what is ripe in a particular week) to local consumers on a weekly basis. By participating in community-supported agriculture, consumers eat local and thereby re-territorialize their food. According to this formulation, enchantment is strongly tied to *place* as consumers see themselves as making environmentally supportive and ethically correct choices. Through sympathetic magical connections contact is forged with the "land" and the life-giving forces it represents while at the same time rejecting the values and ideology associated with industrialized agribusiness.

Other investigations of enchanted consumption [19–21] likewise are compatible with the notion of enhanced enchantment in brick and mortar locations. Notably, Ritzer [1,11] grounds re-enchantment firmly in particular places he terms *cathedrals of consumption* where, as

Ostergaard, Fitchett and Jantzen [23] note, "the level of enchantment connected to a given cathedral of consumption is monitored, evaluated and improved in order to achieve maximum optimization." Despite the affinity of enchantment for brick and mortar distribution channels, enchantment is certainly possible and even likely in digital shopping environments. As a result of the post-modern condition, the meanings attached to products are severed from their traditional stable sociohistorical moorings and instead are given meaning through processes of marketing and advertising.

Further, the symbolic aspects of goods are firmly attached to the imaginative capacities of consumers [24–26]. As Denegri-Knott and Molesworth [27]; p. 115) put it: "we may see the virtual, or imagination, as the main location of consumption and the material as an actualization of these ideals, or where these ideals are performed." Because the role of consumers in the process of meaning making is so profound, enchantment can take place in a variety of distribution channels—both material and digital. Then, using Denegri-Knott's and Molesworth's language, actualization of consumption decisions again can take place in material or digital settings. The case studies we present focus on enchantment present in digital distribution channels and the accompanying cultural techniques employed.

3. Case studies

In the same way that many areas of marketing and strategy have refocused attention on a customer perspective [12], it is clear that logistical relevance and the customer interface is where new developments in logistics will occur [28]. Our case studies examine ways in which logistical relevance (and its attendant value) is created when customer experiences become enchanted in digital contexts.

3.1. Selection of case studies

We present three case studies of digital enchantment of logistics in organizations that function in value networks that are structurally different. In the first, we look at Target Inc., a large brick and mortar discount chain. Although Target has made a strong commitment to its e-commerce business, the retailer still sold only 4.4% of its goods via a digital channel in 2017 [29] and so must primarily be considered a brick and mortar retailer. The store has also done little to involve customers in its value network, relying instead on traditional marketing approaches. Nonetheless, Target has been successful in attracting customers with designer collaborations and we describe their use of digital technology as a way to engage customers by identifying clothing that they prefer. Second, we examine enchantment at Amazon as an example of how enchantment can take place in a value network that is almost exclusively digital [27]. Finally, we turn to Koji BBQ, a hybrid organization that, like Target, distributes its products in face-to-face interactions, but like Amazon, uses digital technology as an integral part of its logistics. These differing cases allow us to identify characteristics of digital enchantment that may be applied in organizations that function in a variety of value networks.

3.2. Hitting the target

Historically, Target Corporation has maintained a strategy of differentiation where the store features merchandise at a variety of price points. A large percentage of the goods sold match the price of other discount chains. However, Target also offers upscale merchandise sold at higher price points [30] and not carried by other discounters. Target's intent is to lure steady customers into the store with an assortment of rotating unique items—constantly surprising consumers with their merchandise [31]. As a way of accenting the upscale merchandise, at the end of the 1990's target began linking with established designers (e.g. Michael Graves, Isaac Mizrahi) to design lines of consumer products ranging from appliances to linens to apparel [32]. The designer cachet

has served Target well, further differentiating the upscale end of their product mix from competitors while using their manufacturing power to assure designer level quality [33]. In 2008 Target and Mizrahi parted ways, and the company launched a new series of design collaborations. So that Target could achieve its goal of product rotation, these collaborations were intended to be limited in time. For example, in 2009 Target partnered with designer Alexander McQueen to produce the McQ Alexander McQueen for Target collection [34]. Overall, Target has presented collaborations with 150 designers [35] with varying levels of success. Although sales from the designer collections have contributed only a fraction to Target's bottom line, the interest and consumer excitement generated by the constantly rotating and potentially surprising designer merchandise has created a level of enchantment at a discount chain that would normally be found only at much smaller and more exclusive sellers.

More recently Target has opened their value network somewhat through a digitally informed collaboration with the WhoWhatWear.com blog. Developed by Target with Katherine Power and Hillary Kerr, former fashion editors of Elle magazine and co-founders of the WhoWhatWear.com blog, the clothing line showed apparel and accessories curated by Who What Wear in Target stores in February 2016. The basis for their choices in this collection was, of course, their taste, but also digitally collected feedback from Target customers and the Who What Wear website with over two million Twitter followers [36]. In announcing the design collaboration, Katherine Power stated, "We've kind of taken our expertise as fashion editors and combined it with what our audience truly wants. We're gonna be tapping into, you know, all of the Target guests and all of our social media followers" [37]. As a result, the collection was produced in part by customers. Under such circumstances, the cynicism that accompanies re-enchantment may well be tempered by customer participation—in the case of Target by customers who recognize their own tastes in the Who What Wear collection.

Certainly, the opportunity to obtain reasonably high-quality merchandise with designer cachet at discount prices is extremely appealing to consumers. However, beyond this, Target's use of a relatively more open value network produced by carrying a clothing line that already looks desirable to customers—has introduced the element of intrigue or enchantment into the shopping process. Such enchantment fosters a degree of engagement with shoppers—engagement with the designer brands presented, with the social media platforms that accompany the Target Who What Wear line, and with merchandise digitally made relevant for customers by engaging them in the curation process.

3.3. Amazon and the algorithmic audience

In the past 25 years, Amazon has pioneered the use of digital distribution channels that rush goods to consumers. Amazon's website has been developed and refined to facilitate transactions so that customers experience maximum convenience. Amazon has focused on logistics to compete successfully with other retailers, emphasizing efficiency and effectiveness. Regarding efficiency, Amazon has chosen to be the low-price leader on items that are the most frequently viewed or that sell best [38] while using dynamic pricing models to take advantage of changes in product demand [39]. Amazon's effectiveness is also well established with a prime corporate value of customer focus. The company has developed tools to improve the customer experience such as 1-click ordering, free shipping (evolving into Amazon Prime), and has developed and refined its website to facilitate transactions [40]; p. 75).

Although Amazon has relied on the logistics of content delivery for their competitive advantage, early in the development of the company's website, they opened their value network to include customers in order to involve them in making purchase recommendations to other customers. They did this by developing software so that customers could receive personalized recommendations for (at first) books. Dubbed *Bookmatch* and then *Selections*, these digital tools sought to personalize

the shopping experience and form the foundation of Amazon's current algorithmic recommendation engine [40]; p. 76).

We propose that Amazon's usage of an algorithmically driven recommendation system works in two distinct ways. On the one hand, the recommendation algorithm is positioned as a solution to help access desirable content and products amid the nearly infinite variety available through 'The Everything Store' [40]. Algorithms that Amazon employs are therefore thought to impact customer purchasing behavior directly. While this may be the case, we also claim that the algorithm operates at a discursive level to position the audience—a process we label the 'algorithmic audience.' Specifically, the audience is positioned by Amazon's discursive claims to assume that the results delivered by recommendation engines (algorithms) are simply delivering to customers what they have already told the algorithm they want to consume. Because of this particular positioning, customers are especially open to the digitally generated and presented suggestions provided by the algorithm and come to view the system as their personal curator. The purpose of these recommendations according to Amazon itself is to "delight our customers by allowing them to serendipitously discover great products" [41]. Customers cast into the position of being an algorithmic audience experience a degree of enchantment because of the personal relevance of the recommendations presented to them. As a member of an algorithmic audience, customers recognize a connection with other, similar individuals. This connection is extended to validate an association with various subcultures [42], taste cultures [43], or lifestyles [44]. Such personal validation is desirable and given that recommendations are always instantly available, are both intriguing and rewarding to customers. Notice that it is the consumption practice that is desired and that this is over and above the value that is provided by any specific product. As a result, the recommendation process itself is engaging and enchanting—beyond the utility provided by particular products.

3.4. Transmedia tacos

Kogi BBQ sits at the forefront of a food truck reinvention. The company started with one truck in November of 2008 and has since spawned a mobile eating revolution. Kogi has gone from one truck to many trucks, and has also developed a stationary sit-down restaurant. Awards have come pouring in, along with plenty of media coverage as Kogi has been reported in many major newspapers from the Los Angeles Times to the New York Times, even being listed as one of Jonathan Gold's 99 top LA eating experiences. Kogi's use of new mediated technology and multiple social media platforms have effectively bridged the gulf between the producer and consumer. No longer is the chef a distant 'other' in the back of a large restaurant, but is now in close proximity, both through food and technology. Taking the food to the streets takes on a form of renaissance–a return to a perhaps mythic age when food was more interactive and participatory. The truck gives a sense of 'street cred' and the raw authenticity associated particularly with long-standing traditions of Mexican taco stands. However, Kogi's manipulation of new technology forged a different relationship with consumers.

Mobile food stands are not new to the cultural food landscape, but this recent re-articulation has been acclaimed as such because it is not just building a relationship with one community but enables a linkage to the cultural heartbeat of an entire city, even one as vast and diverse as Los Angeles. First, you have the Kogibbq.com website run by the sister of one of the founding members, Aliiiice (this is how her screen name is presented on the blog). Interestingly enough, she lives in New York. She has her brother send her pictures of the food as she updates the community on what is going on with Kogi, portraying an interactive story of the growth and some of the inner workings of the company. She makes things very participatory, engaging the audience by allowing the community to help decide on the names of the new trucks, introducing the personalities of the staff, and explaining the stories behind new foods coming out.

Aliiiice relays the latest creations from Chef Roy Choi so you have a

reason to be engaged, to continue to go back every week. This is also the logic behind the majority of food advertising, but oftentimes it lacks the intimacy and trust that Alliiice and the company have massaged through social media. She participates quite deeply with readers, often commenting herself in the comments section of the blog and through social media in a very personal manner.

Sometimes the food is a one-day special, so you are literally compelled by the pictures and descriptions to not miss the food served only on that particular day. These are essentially food stories, narratives that shape the encounter with the product and add layers of meaning to that experience. Here is the story of a Cuban pressed pork dish, Alliiice writes:

> Once upon a time, there was a bun of Pan BLanco. A piLLow-soft, innocent loaf of angeLs' bread fresh from the warm confines of a simpLe baker's oven.::SLiiiiiiiiiiiCE!!: Two hands grabbed the symmetricaL, soft remains of Pan BLanco and shoved them face down on a redhot griLL. Fat sLices of juicy red summer tomatoes and spicy pork gathered 'round to mourn her death. (Kogibbq.com)

But the blog is not the only level of storytelling. The use of Twitter has moved these stories from static places online to dramatic emotion-laden episodes that one can act out as adventures. A series of YouTube videos sprung up around the beginning of Kogi as part of its marketing strategy, but also spontaneously as active audiences filmed and put together their own personal treks to find the Kogi tacos. One of the first to do this was a local area DJ named akaider, the title was called 'Chasing the Dragon (The Kogi BBQ Adventure),' and he was later invited to start performing alongside some of the trucks stops in Little Tokyo in response to his video.

Kogi's twitter feeds make their logistics very participatory and ultimately a significant driver of enchantment. There is an emotional resonance when people are given a space to play and perform as audiences feel empowered to collect information and connect the dots of where the truck will be at any given place and time. There is a certain degree of prestige in uncovering the buzz, but also a great amount of pleasure in sharing that gift in and through social exchanges. This is mobile hypersocial technology [45], as Twitter allows for a conversation never before possible. Twitter feeds and tweets tell about the truck coming to an area, if it is stuck in traffic, if the cops made Kogi move to a new area, or if they ran out of food for the day. People want to collect and have that 'insider' information on the next big eating thing. This knowledge is especially valued in eating circles as a form of status and coolness associated with the pooling of privileged information.

Food is compelling; it is an integral part of our lives. Food is universal and ubiquitous; we all eat. The consumption of food is often a highly public, commercial enterprise. Food consumption is a hypersocial activity. Living in an age of convergence culture [46], where consumers are the focal point of convergence, knowledge and information are conveyed as narrative through social media [57]. Kogi is a small example of how creative artists can maneuver to empower a deeper synergy between distribution and consumption as chefs and diners, food critics and passive consumers all benefit from increased connectivity through digital enchantment.

4. Discussion

Digital enchantment leads to logistical relevance (and its attendant value) on the part of consumers. Past examinations of enchanted consumption situations have emphasized brick and mortar shopping environments; however, our case studies suggest that enchanted consumption can also occur in shopping environments where digital technology is an integral part of the consumption experience. We first consider the role of surprise and then turn to the role of perceived scarcity. Finally, we recognize multiplatform social media marketing and logistics as a way of creating enchantment in consumption

situations.

Our case studies support the role of surprise in the creation of enchantment. In the example of Target's collaboration with the WhoWhatWear blog, the consistent introduction of new merchandise is anticipated as customers plan to be surprised by new merchandise. The blog and Target offer previews of new merchandise online, and many blogs and media outlets now cover the introductions of new seasonal collaborations. The enchantment driven by surprise drives both online and purchases and instore visits. The presentation of the unexpected is also a driver of the popularity of Kogi Tacos. In the transportation-oriented culture of Los Angeles, traveling for food (cruising for burgers) has long been a popular pastime. Add to that the surprise engendered through Twitter feeds giving real-time updates of the location of the food, and the process of obtaining the food—the treasure hunt—becomes as much of a draw as the food itself. Finally, looking at merchandise recommendations on Amazon is a source of surprise both in terms of self-verification ('Oh, I know these books') as well as the genuine discovery of new information or products.

An additional contributor to logistical relevance through enchantment is perceived scarcity. Goods and experiences perceived as scarce are more desirable. Cialdini [47] has identified this as the scarcity heuristic—a judgment shortcut where evaluations of quantity and availability are used to assess the value of an object or experience. By this criterion, things that are scarce are seen as more valuable. Cialdini theorized that the scarcity heuristic operates because of psychological *reactance,* a negative drive state created by perceived restrictions of freedom or choice [48]. Things that we perceive as scarce come to be perceived as more valuable because not possessing the item is seen as a threat to our freedom. The scarcity heuristic applies to both merchandise and the situational contexts within which the merchandise is distributed. Applied to our case studies, the realization by customers that only a limited amount of merchandise is manufactured for each of Target's WhoWhatWear seasons drives demand both in terms of the availability of the merchandise and the amount of time it is available. Both the time and availability conditions restrict choice and potentially create reactance if customers don't buy promptly. To combat such potential restrictions of freedom, customers seek to obtain the scarce merchandise and in addition seek to enjoy the experience of enchantment that accompanies the merchandise. It is critical to note that if the merchandise is sold out, satisfactions from both the item and the enchanted context within which it once was available will be missing. Potential threats to freedom thus impact both merchandise and context.

Finally, it is clear that the context in which such merchandise is purchased may be digital or brick and mortar. Highly popular Target merchandise from their designer collaborations has repeatedly crashed their website due to the high volume of customers trying to purchase the limited amount of merchandise on offer (e.g. Refs. [35]; April 20). Kogi BBQ operates similarly, as each truck carries only a limited amount of ingredients and when the food is gone, the truck closes. Twitter is full of stories of customers who waited in line for substantial amounts of time only to be denied their food at the last minute. These circumstances all operate to increase the desirability of Kogi's food through the perception of scarcity. Potential restrictions of the choice to eat a Kogi taco drive up both the desirability of the product and the desirability of the enchanted context within which it is consumed. Our case studies support the concept that perceived scarcity and the reactance that it generates can be generated in both digital and brick and mortar contexts.

Multiple platforms guide the customer engagement that drives enchantment; digital shopping environments interact with the brick and mortar world to generate a sum greater than its parts. For example, Kogi BBQ's minimal advertising budget forced them to rely on the free Twitter platform to alert customers about their often-changing locations. The social media platform meshed with their physical taco truck to create complementary platforms that together were significantly more impactful than the sum of the two considered separately. In the same way, Amazon's expanding physical bookstore chain [49] features books that have been selected based on online customer responses. For example, the in-store cookbook display features only cookbooks that have been rated online as four-star books or higher. The same is true with a variety of other displays. Customers in the physical bookstore are reassured that they are viewing quality, popular books because of the meshing of Amazon's online rating system with the viewing and touching of the physical books. In addition, Amazon Prime customers (a $99.00 per year premium digital membership that features free shipping) receive discounted prices at Amazon physical bookstores. Experiencing multiple interacting platforms lends to an enchanted, transmediated purchasing environment.

Both Ritzer, (2005) and Thompson and Coskuner-balli [18] see enchantment in opposition to the rationalization of business processes. Returning to Campbell [16]; we consume goods not simply for utilitarian reasons but to also fulfill our consumerist fantasies—consumption daydreams that make the process of consuming an enchanting experience. Campbell asserts that our experience will never live up to our fantasies so that although enchantment is a potentially powerful corrective to the rationalization of consumption, it will always fall short. In addition, as Thompson and Coskuner-balli [18] point out, re-enchantment serves as an ideological veil that obscures the reality that enchantment itself has become rationalized (Ritzer, 2005). Although a number of the examples presented in this paper support such a conclusion, it is also possible to view re-enchantment within the value networks that a service-dominated logic approach prescribes [11]. The digital consumption experiences in our case studies make it easy for suppliers to intentionally involve their customers in perfecting and presenting their services so that the goal of relevant logistics can be realized. For example, in Targets's WhoWhatWear designer collaboration, the basis for the choices in this collection was, of course, the design curator's taste, but feedback from Target customers and the Who What Wear website with over two million Twitter followers [36] was also a significant part of the selection criteria. The collection was produced in part by customers. Under such circumstances, the cynicism that accompanies re-enchantment may well be tempered by customer participation—in the case of Target by customers who recognize their own tastes in the Who What Wear collection. It is important to point out that such customer participation would be impossible without a digital communication channel that allows for customer feedback.

Participation in the production of the product also plays a significant role in the digital enchantment experience and cultural techniques orchestrated by Kogi BBQ. Herein, Kogi is not only selling food, but also the experience of consuming it—part of which is locating the truck in the greater Los Angeles area. Customers are therefore intimately involved in the production of the 'treasure hunt' that is integral to the Kogi experience. The company tweets location information, but it is then the choice and responsibility of the customer to commit to the cruise for food. The customer choice and commitment associated with going on the hunt for Kogi tacos is in opposition to a calculated maneuver on the part of the seller and can be seen as a corrective to corporate manipulations. Kogi can be representative of larger cultural shifts and trends. It is a Korean and Latin fusion cooking driven by new mediated technologies and platforms that allow for increased sharing and participating. Kogi's networked ecology would be impossible without the digital linkages the company cultivated as we move further into the hybridity and diversity of a networked, enchanted world.

Re-enchantment directed at veiling continued rationalized consumption processes remains a powerful influence on consumers but as consumer sophistication continues to grow, such enchantment is likely unsustainable over time. Rather, a conceptualization of logistics as part of loosely coupled value networks that subsume traditional value and distribution chains suggest that integrating customer participation is essential to provide a complete account of logistical processes. Digital shopping experiences make entry and continued participation in these value networks easy and convenient; and in the case of social distancing, necessary. Our case studies support the view that customers can be

enchanted by using ubiquitous digital devices and platforms. As a result, enchantment may be co-produced digitally in cooperation with customers, suggesting that enchanting logistics may not entirely be due to the strict calculations of corporations. As corporations seek to provide logistical solutions that are relevant to customers, digital enchantment becomes a tool that allows for differentiation from competitors and increasing levels of fit between products and consumers.

5. Conclusion

Logistical channels have traditionally contributed to value chains through efficient management of costs and effective, timely delivery of a desirable assortment of merchandise. Our case studies suggest that enchanted digital logistical channels extend this function by creating consumption circumstances that surprise and intrigue, that suggest perceived scarcity, and that use social media to approach consumers in multiple ways to procure enchantment. Enchanted consumption contexts expand the value created by traditional logistical processes and our case studies support the position that such enchantment can occur in both digital and brick and mortar consumption environments.

CRediT authorship contribution statement

Benjamin Burroughs: Conceptualization, Data curation, Formal analysis, Funding acquisition, Investigation, Methodology, Project administration, Resources, Software, Supervision, Validation, Visualization, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing. **W. Jeffrey Burroughs:** Conceptualization, Formal analysis, Writing - original draft, Writing - review & editing.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data to this article can be found online at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techsoc.2020.101277.

References

[1] Gordon Allport, Personality: A Psychological Interpretation, Holt, New York, 1937.
[2] Alexandra Alter, N. Wingfield, A Trip through Amazon's First Physical Store, New York Times, 2016. Retrieved from, http://www.nytimes.com/2016/03/12/business/media/a-virtual-trip-through-amazons-physical-store.html.
[3] Eric Arnould, C. Thompson, Consumer culture theory (CCT): twenty years of research, J. Consum. Res. 31 (4) (2005) 868–882.
[4] Jean Baudrillard, Simulacra and Simulation, University of Michigan Press, Ann Arbor, MI, 1994.
[5] Thomas Birtchnell, J. Urry, The mobilities and post-mobilities of cargo, Consum. Mark. Cult. 18 (1) (2015) 25–38.
[6] Boomerang Commerce, Introduction to Price Perception Index (PPI): Achieving Competitive Pricing without Racing to the Bottom, Boomerang Commerce, Chicago, IL, 2015. Retrieved from, https://www.yumpu.com/en/document/read/35229390/download.
[7] Wendy Bounds, Discounters dress themselves up to lure well-heeled shoppers, Wall St. J. (1997, December 3). Retrieved from, https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB881110153809297500.
[8] Sharon S. Brehm, Jack W. Brehm, Psychological reactance: A Theory of Freedom and Control, Academic Press, Cambridge, MA, 1981.
[9] Robert Cialdini, Influence: Science and Practice, fourth ed., Allyn and Bacon, Boston, 2001.
[10] Colin Campbell, The Romantic Ethic and the Spirit of Modern Consumerism, Blackwell, Oxford, 1987.
[11] Steven P. Dandaneau, Robin M. Dodsworth, A consuming passion: an interview with George Ritzer, Consum. Mark. Cult. 11 (3) (2008) 191–201.
[12] Janice Denegri-Knott, M. Molesworth, Concepts and practices of digital virtual consumption, Consum. Mark. Cult. 13 (2) (2010) 109–132.
[13] Mary Douglas, Baron Isherwood, The World of Goods, Routledge, London, 1979.
[14] Paul du Gay, Guest editor's introduction, Consum. Mark. Cult. 7 (2) (2004) 99–105.
[15] Sharon Edelson, McQueen on Target, Women's Wear Daily, 2008, November 18. Retrieved from, https://wwd.com/fashion-news/designer-luxury/mcqueen-on-target-1863903/.
[16] Herbert Gans, Popular Culture and High Culture: an Analysis and Evaluation of Taste, Basic Books, New York, 1974.
[17] Dick Hebdige, Subculture: the Meaning of Style, Routledge, New York, 1979.

[19] Douglas B. Holt, Poststructuralist lifestyle analysis: conceptualizing the social patterning of consumption in postmodernity, J. Consum. Res. 23 (4) (1997) 326–350.
[20] Tiffany Hsu, Retailers Experiment with a New Philosophy: Smaller Is Better, The New York Times, 2017, November, 17, p. B1.
[21] Mizuko Ito, Introduction, in: Kazys Varnelis (Ed.), Networked Publics, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 2008, pp. 1–14.
[22] Henry Jenkins, Convergence Culture: where Old and New Media Collide, New York University Press, New York, 2006.
[23] Marek Korczynski, Ursula Ott, The menu in society: mediating structures of power and enchanting myths of individual sovereignty, Sociology 40 (5) (2006) 911–928.
[24] Beryl Langer, The business of branded enchantment: ambivalence and disjuncture in the global children's culture industry, J. Consum. Cult. 4 (2) (2004) 251–277.
[25] Scott Lash, John Urry, Economies of Signs and Space, SAGE Publications, London, 1994.
[26] Walter Loeb, Amazon's Pricing Strategy Makes Life Miserable for the Competition, Forbes, 2014, November 20. Retrieved from, https://www.forbes.com/sites/walterloeb/2014/11/20/amazons-pricing-strategy-makes-life-miserable-for-the-competition/#3be7dd0e5c60.
[27] Robert Lusch, Stephen L. Vargo, Mohan Tanniru, Service, value networks and learning, J. Acad. Market. Sci. 38 (1) (2010) 19–31.
[28] Robert Lusch, Reframing supply chain management: a service-dominant logic perspective, J. Supply Chain Manag. 47 (1) (2011) 14–18.
[29] J.P. Mangalindan, Amazon's Recommendation Secret, Fortune, 2012 July 30. Retrieved from, http://fortune.com/2012/07/30/amazons-recommendation-secret/.
[31] Dino Numerato, Revisiting Weber's concept of disenchantment: an examination of the re-enchantment with sailing in the post-communist Czech Republic, Sociology 43 (3) (2009) 439–456.
[32] Per Østergaard, James Fitchett, Christian Jantzen, A critique of the ontology of consumer enchantment, J. Consum. Behav. 12 (5) (2013) 337–344.
[35] George Ritzer, Enchanting a Disenchanted World: Revolutionizing the Means of Consumption, 3rd edition, Pine Forge Press, Thousand Oakes CA, 2010.
[36] Michael Saler, Modernity and enchantment: a historiographic review, Am. Hist. Rev. 111 (3) (2006) 692–716.
[37] Raquel Sanchez-Fernandez, Iniesta-Bonillo, M. Angeles, The concept of perceived value: a systematic review of the research, Market. Theor. 7 (4) (2007) 427–451.
[39] Julie Schlosser, How Target Does it, Fortune, 2004, 18 October, pp. 100–112.
[40] Theodore P. Stank, Chad Autry, Patricia Daugherty, David Closs, Reimagining the 10 megatrends that will revolutionize supply chain logistics, Transport. J. 54 (1) (2015) 7–32.
[41] D. Stankevich, The envy of department stores, Retail Merch. 42 (12) (2002) 33–35.
[42] Brad Stone, The Everything Store, Little Brown, New York, 2013.
[44] Target, Q4 & Full-Year 2019 Earnings Complete Press Release, Press Release, 2020. Retrieved from, https://corporate.target.com/press/releases/2020/03/target-reports-fourth-quarter-and-full-year-2019-e.
[45] Target-A Bullseye View, Go behind the Scenes of WhoWhatWear X Target's Design Partnership! [Video Transcript], 2016. Retrieved from, https://corporate.target.com/Videos-Transcripts/14566/Who-What-Wear-Partnership-Video.
[46] Craig J. Thompson, Coskuner-Balli, Gokcen, Enchanting ethical consumerism: the case of community supported agriculture, J. Consum. Cult. 7 (3) (2007) 275–303.
[47] Twitter, Who what Wear, Twitter, 2020, April, 2. Retrieved from, https://twitter.com/whowhatwear?lang=en.
[48] Stephen L. Vargo, Robert F. Lusch, Evolving to a new dominant logic for Marketing, J. Market. 68 (1) (2004) 1–17.
[49] Stephen L. Vargo, Robert F. Lusch, The service-dominant logic: what it is, what it is not, what it might be, in: Robert R. Lusch, Stephen L. Vargo (Eds.), The Service-dominant Logic of Marketing: Dialog, Debate, and Directions, M.E. Sharpe, Armonk, New York, 2006, pp. 42–56.
[50] Phil Wahba, Why Target's Web Snafus with Lilly Pulitzer Are Good News, Fortune, 2015, April 20. Retrieved from, http://fortune.com/2015/04/20/target-lilly-pulitzer-good-news/.
[51] Max Weber, The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism, Routledge, New York, 1905/2002.
[52] Robert B. Woodruff, Customer value: the next source of competitive advantage, J. Acad. Market. Sci. 25 (2) (1997) 139–153.
[53] Ali Yakhlef, The internet as an opportunity to rethink the role of the intermediary, Consum. Mark. Cult. 4 (1) (2011) 39–55.
[54] Atefeh Yazdanparast, Ila Manuj, Stephen M. Swartz, Co-creating logistics value: a service-dominant logic perspective, Int. J. Logist. Manag. 21 (3) (2010) 375–403.
[55] Valarie A. Zeithaml, Consumer perception of price, quality and value: a means-end model and synthesis of evidence, J. Market. 52 (3) (1988) 2–22.
[56] A. Zimmerman, Do designer duds make the grade? Wall St. J. (2009, April 21). Retrieved from, https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB124028074444937889.
[57] Benjamin Burroughs, Adam Rugg, David Becker, Madeline Edgmon, et al., #VegasStrong: Sport, public memorialization, and the golden knights, Commun. Sport (2019), https://doi.org/10.1177/2167479519855085.

Benjamin Burroughs is an assistant professor of emerging media at the University of Nevada, Las Vegas (UNLV) in the Hank Greenspun School of Journalism and Media Studies. His research focuses on streaming media and technology, media industries, and digital media. His work has been published in journals such as *New Media and Society*, *Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media*, and *Games and Culture*.

W. Jeffrey Burroughs is Emeritus Professor of Psychology at Brigham Young University-Hawaii. He teaches in the area of social psychology and personality and has written on consumption and identity and the self-attribution of internal states. He is co-editor of *We are a People: Narrative and Multiplicity in Constructing Ethnic Identity*. His current research investigates ways in which mediated experiences impact identity.