# Gender Mainstreaming in the Transparency Fund

Prepared for the Transparency Fund by: Kristen Sample



# Gender Mainstreaming in the Transparency Fund

Prepared for the Transparency Fund by: Kristen Sample



Inter-American Development Bank

Copyright © 2018 Inter-American Development Bank. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons IGO 3.0 Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives (CC-IGO BY-NC-ND 3.0 IGO) license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/3.0/ igo/legalcode) and may be reproduced with attribution to the IDB and for any non-commercial purpose. No derivative work is allowed.

Any dispute related to the use of the works of the IDB that cannot be settled amicably shall be submitted to arbitration pursuant to the UNCITRAL rules. The use of the IDB's name for any purpose other than for attribution, and the use of the IDB's logo shall be subject to a separate written license agreement between the IDB and the user and is not authorized as part of this CC-IGO license.

Note that the link provided above includes additional terms and conditions of the license.

The opinions expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Inter-American Development Bank, its Board of Directors, or the countries they represent.



Inter-American Development Bank 1300 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20577 www.iadb.org

#### Acknowledgments

This document was made possible thanks to the generous contributions of the IDB Transparency Fund donors: Government of Canada, Government of Italy, Government of Norway, Government of Sweden, and MasterCard Corporation. The author is grateful for the inputs received from Francesco De Simone, Roberto de Michele, Darinka Vasquez Jordan, Vivian Roza, Robert Pantzer, and Denisse Wolfenzon, as well as valuable comments and suggestions offered by Nicolas Dassen, Maria Jose Jarquin, and Juan Cruz Vieyra.

# Contents

Executive Summary	V
<ul> <li>Chapter 1: Introduction</li> <li>1.1 Objective of this Guide</li> <li>1.2 The Transparency Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank</li> <li>1.3 Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in terms of the Inter-American Development Bank</li> </ul>	1 1 1 3
<ul> <li>Chapter 2: Links between Gender and Transparency</li> <li>2.1 More Women, Less Corruption?</li> <li>2.2 Are Women and Men Affected Differently by Corruption?</li> <li>2.3 Sexual Exploitation as a Form of Corruption</li> <li>2.4 Do Men and Women React Differently to Corruption?</li> <li>2.4.1 Legal recourse</li> <li>2.4.2 Legal protections</li> </ul>	5 6 9 10 10
<ul> <li>Chapter 3: Key Questions for Gender Mainstreaming across Fund Pillars</li> <li>3.1 Do Women and Men Benefit Equally from the Project and How Can We Know That?</li> <li>3.2 Are Women Providing and Accessing the Information?</li> <li>3.3 Do Women Have a Voice in Decision Making? Are There Opportunities for Engaging Women's Organizations?</li> <li>3.4 Does the Project Present Gender-Based Risks?</li> <li>3.5 Does the Project Reach Women across Social, Economic, and Ethnic/ Racial Identities?</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>13</li> <li>13</li> <li>14</li> <li>14</li> <li>15</li> <li>16</li> </ol>
Chapter 4: Gender Mainstreaming by Transparency Fund Pillar 4.1 Financial Integrity 4.1.1 Anti-money laundering	<b>17</b> 17 17

iii

4.2 Control Systems	19
4.2.1 Gender equality audits	19
4.2.2 Gender-responsive complaint systems	20
4.3 Natural Resource Governance	21
4.3.1 Gender-smart contract negotiations	21
4.3.2 Analyses and mapping of extractive industry impacts	22
4.3.3 Gender planning for the use of extractive industry revenue	22
4.4 Open Government	22
4.4.1 Open Government Partnership compliance	23
4.4.2 E-government	23
4.4.3 Gender-responsive budgeting	23
4.4.4 Information and communications technology: policy and innovation	24
4.4.5 Leveling the procurement playing field	25
4.4.6 Civil service diagnostics	26
4.4.7 Community mapping	26
4.4.8 Performance monitoring	26
4.4.9 FixMyStreet Initiatives	27
4.4.10 Improved case management and transparency in the judicial branch	27
4.5 Sextortion: An Emerging Area	28
4.5.1 Data collection and research	28
4.5.2 Legal framework review and reform	28
4.5.3 Codes of conduct	29
4.5.4 Awareness raising and complaints mechanisms	29
Chapter 5: Monitoring and Evaluation	31
References	35

# **Executive Summary**

### Introduction

Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) have seen, in recent years, a sharp uptick in public mobilization against corruption, as well as the adoption of transparency and accountability-enhancing reform. In most cases however, these anticorruption measures have not been designed to ensure that women and men benefit equally, despite ample evidence of the gender effects of corruption. For instance, research across countries and regions has found that women tend to suffer more from corruption, given their higher rate of poverty, responsibility for family care, dependence on public services, and conditions of discrimination and marginalization. There are also indications of gender imbalances in the response to corruption, with women less likely to report corruption, due perhaps to more limited access to information.

Created in 2007, the Transparency Fund (hereafter referred to as Fund) of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) has worked closely with LAC country members to support their capacity in addressing public sector corruption. The Fund has supported more than 50 projects in four areas:

- Financial Integrity
- Control Systems
- Natural Resource Governance
- Open Government

The present guide aims to support gender mainstreaming within the Fund to ensure that the IDB's transparency projects are responsive to the needs of women and men. The guide includes research findings, orienting questions, examples of good practice, potential entry points for programming, and suggested indicators.

# **Cross-cutting Questions for Mainstreaming**

Consistent with the IDB's commitment to gender mainstreaming in all its supported sectors, a series of cross-cutting questions should be considered during project design:

- Do women and men benefit equally from the project? How can we know this?
- Are women providing and accessing the information?
- Do women have a voice in decision making?
- Does the project present gender-based risks?
- Does the project reach women across social, economic, ethnic, and racial divides?

### Gender Mainstreaming by Transparency Pillar

While the above cross-cutting questions are applicable to all types of transparency projects, there are also challenges and opportunities that are specific to each of the four pillars. Of the more than 20 gender mainstreaming entry points identified in the guide, the following activities with member countries could be considered particularly apt for prioritization, based on ongoing efforts and contextual urgency.

#### **Financial Integrity**

vi

- Gender analysis of national risk assessments of money-laundering and terrorist financing, including a focus on tracking revenues derived from human trafficking.
- Analysis and reform to mitigate due diligence requirements that have the potential to reduce access to financial services for women.

#### **Control Systems**

• Design and implementation of audits that assess a government's capacity to fulfill gender equality obligations associated with the Sustainable Development Goals.

#### **Natural Resource Governance**

• Develop gender mapping of the benefits and impacts of projects funded by extractive industry revenue.

# **Open Government**

- Integration of gender-specific commitments in Open Government Partnership action plans and the participation of women in national committees.
- Digitalization and simplification of administrative processes that are, in particular, responsive to the needs of women.
- Awareness raising and reform to encourage competition in procurement processes to increase women's participation.
- Development of procedures and criteria to ensure gender-responsive budget analysis during legislative development.
- Design of participatory geo-mapping projects that include gender analysis and equal participation between women and men.

vii

# Introduction

### **1.1** Objective of this Guide

The present guide is intended as a tool for gender mainstreaming within the Transparency Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) (hereafter referred to as the Fund). Designed to ensure that the Fund identifies and designs projects that are responsive to the needs of women and men alike, the guide includes research findings, orienting questions, examples of good practice, potential entry points for programming, and suggested indicators.

"Gender mainstreaming is the process that seeks to have gender equality and the needs of women and men be heard and addressed in the design, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of the IDB Group's interventions" (IDB, 2017b).

# 1.2 The Transparency Fund of the Inter-American Development Bank

The IDB established, in 2007, the Anticorruption Activities Trust Fund (now called the "Transparency Fund) within its Division of Innovation for Citizen Services. It aims to "strengthen the institutional capacity of the Bank's borrowing member countries to prevent and control corruption" (IDB, 2016). Created with support provided by the Royal Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (with a total contribution to date of US\$12.4 million), the Fund has also received, since then contributions from Canada (US\$9.1 million), Italy (US\$1.2 million), MasterCard (US\$0.9 million), Sweden (US\$.5 million), and the IDB (US\$1.2 million).

Since its inception, the Fund has supported 56 projects in 20 countries. An evaluation carried out in 2017 found that the Fund's performance had been "impressive," having met or exceeded nearly all output targets, as well as demonstrating "remarkable progress in enhancing the effectiveness of institutions" (Trapnell, 2017). As outlined in its strategic framework, the Fund prioritizes programming in four pillars:

2

- Financial Integrity: Includes (a) anti-money laundering (AML) and counterterrorist financing; and (b) enhanced transparency in tax systems and measures to tackle tax havens and offshore activities.
- Control Systems: Aim to strengthen internal and external government audit entities for traditional financial audits, as well as sector and performance audits, based on risk analysis.
- Natural Resource Governance: Seeks to enhance transparency and access to information regarding the benefits and impacts of the extractive industries.
- Open Government (OG): Promotes access to information and encourages citizen participation in the design, implementation, and monitoring of public policies, services, budgets, and spending.<sup>1</sup>

Within these four areas, the range of programming options is vast. Four guiding principles help to narrow further the thematic focus of the Fund:

- The Fund recognizes that transparency in its simplest form—the disclosure of standardized information—is insufficient to reduce corruption. To be effective as a policy tool, information must be understood and used by the public for decision making, while government agencies must perceive and act on the public's responses. With this in mind, the Fund is based on the concept of "targeted transparency" which discourages "simply placing data in the public domain," emphasizing instead a focus on content that is "user friendly, customized and interactive" (Fung et al., 2007; Dassen and Vieyra, 2012).
- As implied by the IDB's objective on "institutional capacity," projects primarily focus on strengthening the ability of government institutions.
- The Fund prioritizes activities with potential for replication and scale up for a broader scope within a country or between countries.
- The Fund focuses on innovative initiatives, and it relies on the use of cutting-edge technology with a strong emphasis on developing knowledge in its areas of operation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For a more comprehensive overview of each pillar, see Trapnell (2017).

# **1.3 Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment in terms of the Inter-American Development Bank**

In 2010, the IDB approved the Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development (GN-2531-6) to strengthen the Bank's response to the goals and commitments of its member countries in the Latin America and the Caribbean (LAC) region to promote gender equality and the empowerment of women. The IDB's commitment to gender equality is consistent with international legal obligations to gender equality, including the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, which has been ratified by all governments of the region. In addition to human rights-based arguments, global research has discovered also that gender equality is an essential ingredient for sustainable progress toward economic and social development.

Through its Gender Action Plan 2017–2019, the IDB seeks to promote gender equality in all projects and analytical work as well as to mitigate negative gender-based impacts on women and men that could occur as a result of IDB projects. The support of IDB for gender equality and women's empowerment is channeled through the following mechanisms (IDB, 2017a):

- Gender mainstreaming: Integration of gender issues across development sectors and throughout the design, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation of its operations.
- Direct investment: Direct support in strategic areas through knowledge and capacity-building products.
- Gender safeguards: Review of financial operations to identify and address impacts and the risks of gender-based exclusion.

# Links between Gender and Transparency

In order to design transparency projects that meet the needs of women and men alike, it is necessary to understand the relationship between gender and the broader context of corruption. The following analysis examines the literature by academics and practitioner organizations in terms of potential causal mechanisms, as well as the costs and impacts of corruption by gender.

# 2.1 More Women, Less Corruption?

Evidence is mixed with regard to the question of whether women are less corrupt than men. Early research from the World Bank points to a correlation between higher levels of women in parliament and lower levels of corruption (Dollar, Fisman, and Gatti, 1999). In seeking to replicate the World Bank research, however, another study concludes "that neither having more women in government at a point in time nor increasing women's representation in government over time affects corruption..." (Sung, 2012). Similarly, research by the United Nations Development Programme found no correlation between the levels of women's representation and corruption in Latin America (UNDP, 2014a).

 A number of studies have concluded that to the extent there may be a correlation between gender and corruption, it is context dependent—linked, in particular, to the interplay with institutional factors and gender socialization.<sup>2</sup> The following are examples:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The importance of culture in influencing women's participation also has been highlighted in research, based on experimental design methods (Alatas et al., 2009).

- Research based on experimental design indicates that gender has no statistically significant effect on the probability of offering a bribe, although women are less likely to accept a payment if the briber is a woman (Rivas, 2008).
- Women's presence—as a factor for reduced corruption—may matter more in elected office as opposed to bureaucracies where interactions are governed by organizational norms more than personal experience (Stensöta, H., L. Wängnerud, and R. Svensson. 2015).
- The correlation between women in politics and lower levels of corruption may hold true in democracies, but not authoritarian regimes. Combining the factors of institutional development and gender socialization, the researchers hypothesize that, as a disadvantaged group, women have a stronger self-interest in adhering to norms. Since democracies are associated with anti-corruption norms, gender differences appear in these contexts rather than in authoritarian ones (Esarey and Chirillo, 2013).

A related line of inquiry has centered on gender roles, positing that women may be less corrupt because they have been socialized to avoid risk and exert higher levels of self-control than men (Swamy et al., 2001). Another school of thought holds that corruption depends on exposure rather than women's essential nature. In other words, to the extent that women are less corrupt, it is because they are largely excluded from corrupt networks or opportunities for engaging in corrupt activities (Goetz, 2007). This focus on access is consistent with research from Ghana (Alhassan-Alolo, 2007), which found that when exposed to an opportunity involving corruption, women in public life do not prove to be less corrupt than men. Table 1 summarizes the theories that address the still unresolved question of whether women are less corrupt than men.

# 2.2 Are Women and Men Affected Differently by Corruption?

On the question of whether men or women pay more bribes, the evidence is disparate. Men report paying bribes at a somewhat higher rate (Rheinbay and Chêne, 2016; Vanderbilt University, 2010; 2012) or roughly equal (GCB, 2013) in proportion to women. Global averages, however, can mask significant differences between nations. For instance, the Global Corruption Barometer of Transparency International (TI) found that 27 percent of Colombian women reported paying bribes, compared to 16 percent of

Theory	Effect <sup>a</sup>	
Essentialist	More women in decision-making roles translates into less corruption	
Institutionalist	The type and quality of democratic institutions conditions the relationship between gender and corruption	
Socialization	Women are more risk averse and exert greater self-control	
Exposure	Women have less access to corrupt networks and men are less likely to pay bribes to women	

# Table 1. **Theories that Address whether Women are Less Corrupt than Men**

Source: Table adapted from Grimes and Wängnerud (2015).

<sup>a</sup> Even though debate on whether women's presence in politics and public administration leads to less corruption continues to be unresolved, it is important to note that the basis for women's participation in governance structures at all levels is a matter of universal human rights and a cause in and of itself. In fact, justifying women's inclusion based on an instrumentalist case for ethical government could prove counterproductive as cases of women engaging in corruption come to light.

men (Ibid.). Rates also vary by sector, as evidenced by a study of corruption in public land offices in Bangladesh, whereby social and cultural barriers force women to work through brokers and to pay bribes at higher rates than men (TI, 2015).

There is consensus, nevertheless, on at least one point; that is, the effects of corruption strike the poor disproportionately, and women are particularly affected due to their higher rates of poverty<sup>3</sup> and responsibility for family care. Women's vulnerability is especially acute in cases of "need-based corruption" (Bauhr, 2012; Bauhr and Wängnerud, 2016), where bribes are often linked to basic services (Asiedu, 2016).

The cost of bribes falls hardest on those who are least able to afford them. One study in Mexico discovered that one-third of the poorest families' incomes is spent on bribery payments (Steiner, 2017). This illegal "tax" limits the ability of households to meet other essential basic needs, particularly for households headed by women, which are more likely to be extremely poor compared to those headed by men.<sup>4</sup>

In Latin America, corruption in the public sector is prevalent—with up to 20 percent of survey respondents who had used health care having reported paying bribes (Pring, 2017)—and often gendered. Research in Nicaragua evidenced that women's greater dependence on the public health system, particularly during their reproductive years, left them more vulnerable to corruption in that sector (TI, 2014). In some cases, poor women are compelled to pay bribes to health personnel,

7

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 3}$  The proportion represents 70 percent of the world's poor and 65 percent of the world's illiterate (Lim, 1996).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Urban households with children and a female economic head are a third more likely to be extremely poor compared with those headed by a male (20 percent versus 15 percent) (World Bank, 2012).

even under life-threatening situations such as complicated birth delivery or serious illness of a child (UNDP and UNIFEM, 2010: 5).

When corruption diverts resources away from public services, women also suffer more from the consequent reductions in quality and quantity. A study, using data from 21 member countries of the Organisation for Co-operation and Development for the 1998–2011 period found that corruption led to reduced public expenditures relating to education and health (Jajkowicz and Drobistzova, 2015). Corruption in the water and sanitation sector also has a gender impact, given women's traditional responsibility for carrying water, washing, and cooking (Cap-Net and GWA, 2014). In one survey on the impacts of corruption, grassroots women highlight the nondelivery of public goods and services as "a cause, consequence and intrinsic component of corrupt practices" (UNDP, 2012: 3).

Women's higher rate of participation in the informal sector is another factor affecting vulnerability levels. Research in Uganda shows that 43 percent of women business owners reported harassment (including threats to close them down and demands for bribes and illegally collected taxes) by corrupt officials compared with 25 percent among all business owners (Ellis, Manuel and Blackden, 2006).

Corruption also can have gender impacts in the formal economic sector. In contexts where procurement processes or business services are greased through corruption, women may be disadvantaged due to the perception that they are less corruptible or because of their more limited access to corrupt old boy networks (Transparency Rwanda, undated).

Gender imbalances also play out in the case of corrupt judiciaries, which may serve "to reinforce existing discrimination, explicitly and implicitly" (TI, 2014: 5). When women lack resources, their civil rights may go unprotected on key issues such as marriage, divorce, child custody, land rights, financial independence, and personal security (Ibid.). Bribes to police officers often protect the perpetrators of criminal acts against women (TI, 2010). Even the perception of corruption in the courts is sufficient to make women less inclined to report violence or participate in a case (UN Women, 2012). This may be particularly true in cases of domestic violence, where dropped charges can leave a woman at greater risk from her abuser.

Recent research has given a new spin to the seminal research of the World Bank (Dollar, Fisman, and Gatti, 1999) that found that more women in politics leads to less corruption. Subnational studies relating to Europe and Mexico reverse the relationship, positing that it is the presence of corruption that limits the number of women in politics (Sundström and Wängnerud, 2016). That is, there are less female politicians in corrupt governments because recruitment takes place



through processes that are opaque, clientelistic, crony based and male dominated. In some cases, the gender gap in corrupt contexts may be related to imbalances in access to (corrupt) political finance that skirt the campaign finance rules or such financing is provided by illicit actors.

### 2.3 Sexual Exploitation as a Form of Corruption

Women's greater vulnerability to sexual exploitation produces a gendered form of corruption. The term "sextortion" was first coined by the International Association of Women Judges. It refers to the demand for sexual favors by men in positions of power. In some cases, women may be sexually abused as a condition for receiving public services (UNDP, 2014a: 14). Sextortion appears to be particularly common in schools, where girls and women are often pressured to have sex in order to receive a passing grade.

Gender-based corruption is also common in the workplace, where human resource processes (e.g. hiring, salary, retention) may be conditioned on sexual harassment. One study in Rwanda found that women accounted for 84.5 percent of victims of gender-based corruption in the workplace compared with 15.5 percent of men (Transparency Rwanda, undated).

Additionally, trafficking in persons (TiP)<sup>5</sup>—whereby 80 percent of victims are women (Boehm and Sierra, 2015)—is dependent on corruption within the justice and law enforcement systems. TiP is often closely connected to other illicit enterprises and a host of negative social impacts.

Sextortion is a particularly difficult form of corruption to gauge and address. Legal definitions and frameworks are generally inadequate; (given) elements of corruption and sexual extortion, it (sextortion) often eludes prosecution as either" (Thompson Reuters Foundation, 2015: 28). Lack of information also is a barrier in that victims might avoid reporting abuse because of the misperception that these situations involve some form of consent or due to a lack of clarity regarding

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Trafficking in persons is defined as "the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs." (UNODC, 2004: Article 3, Trafficking in Persons Protocol).

10

Illegal mining illustrates the complexities and connections between corruption and gender. There is evidence from research in Peru that approximately 2,000 sex workers—of whom 60 percent were minors—were employed in the illegal gold mining town of Delta 1. These illegal mining operations also presented other (gendered) negative externalities, including the dumping of more than 30 tons of mercury in rivers and lakes in the region every year, generating levels as high as 34 times the safe limit for women of childbearing age. The Peruvian tax authority (Superintendencia Nacional de Aduanas y de Administración Tributaria, or SUNAT) estimates that 35 tons of contraband gold, worth over US\$1 billion, were transported through Lima to Switzerland and the United States between February and October 2014.

Source: Bird and Krauer (2017).

complaint processes (Ibid.). Finally, data on the full dimensions of sexual extortion and the ability to respond are also limited given the social stigmas and deep marginalization of the victims (UNDP, 2014: 14).

# 2.4 Do Men and Women React Differently to Corruption?

#### 2.4.1 Legal recourse

Evidence varies on the question of whether men or women have less tolerance for corruption (GCB, 2013; TI, 2007). In any event, differences are likely to be context dependent. One study found that women condemn corruption at a higher rate than men only in democracies where corruption is stigmatized to a higher degree (Esarey and Chirillo, 2013). Another theory posits that women have lower tolerance due to their own exclusion from participating in or benefitting from corruption (Bauhr and Wängnerud, 2016); that is, women are less likely to tolerate corruption because "it is those excluded from the system who have incentives to bring about change, while those with access to power generally benefit from upholding the exclusionary system" (Grimes and Wängnerud, 2016).

Research by TI found that women only accounted for 38 percent of corruptionrelated complaints received by its Advocacy and Legal Advice Centres operating in more than 60 countries across the world (TI, 2014: 5–6). In Uganda, focus groups found that women were less likely to report corruption, in part because they were less informed of the channels and because they perceive that to be a role for men (Nordic Consulting Group, 2009: 25). The gender gap in public office may also put women at a disadvantage for holding corrupt officials to account. To the extent that women are underrepresented in public administration, male public servants may "deliberately misrepresent and complicate government processes for women", such that women are less likely to report corruption (TI, 2010). Corrupt officials use women's vulnerabilities to their advantage targeting women over men "passible beguve (they) consider women to

advantage, targeting women over men "possibly because (they) consider women to be more susceptible to coercion, violence or threats, or less aware of where or how to file a complaint" (UNDP, 2008).

Gender disparities in access to information also represent a challenge for anticorruption progress. One global study evidenced a gender gap (42 percent men versus 36 percent women) in awareness levels regarding access to information rights (World Justice Project, 2015). The broad range of challenges involved in bridging that gap has been summed up as 7 C's and 1 F: capacity, cash, childcare, confidence, control, consciousness, culture, and fear (Neuman, 2016). Not surprisingly, access to information has a significant impact on anti-corruption efforts. In one study, women who were aware of the existence of anti-corruption laws and funds in their country reported having fought corruption more often (63 percent) than those who lacked this information (34 percent) (UNDP, 2012).

The digital divide—including internet access and digital skills—could account for some of the gender imbalance in access to information. Research in 86 countries has found that national information and communication technology (ICT) strategies often include rhetorical commitments to gender equality, although they lack concrete commitments and the resources to make them a reality (World Wide Web Foundation, 2015). A survey of 10 countries from Africa, Asia, and Latin America discovered that women respondents were 50 percent less likely than men to be online and 30-50 percent less likely to use the internet for political or economic empowerment (World Wide Web Foundation, 2008–2018).

#### 2.4.2 Legal protections

Whistleblower legislation represents a key safeguard to ensure that employees who report corruption are protected from dismissal, demotion, or harassment.<sup>6</sup> While

11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Transparency International defines whistleblowing "as the disclosure or reporting of wrongdoing, which includes corruption, criminal offences, breaches of legal obligation, miscarriages of justice, specific dangers to public health, safety or the environment, abuse of authority, unauthorized use of public funds or property, gross waste or mismanagement, conflict of interest, and acts to cover up any of the aforementioned."

the United Nations Convention against Corruption requires countries to consider adopting whistleblower legislation, a study found that only four of 23 European Union countries had legal frameworks that qualified as comprehensive (TI, 2013). In Latin America, whistleblower protections are the exception, rather than norm, although momentum appears to be growing.<sup>7</sup> Whistleblower protections have clear gender implications in cases involving sextortion or sexual harassment in the public sector. There may also be gender differences in terms of consequences for whistleblowers. At least one study found that women whistleblowers reported suffering retaliation from their supervisors (including poor performance reviews, harassment, and intimidation) at higher rates than men (Levinson, 2008).

#### Takeaways from the research:

- Evidence is mixed on the question of whether women are less corrupt than men. In contexts where women appear to be less corrupt, it is likely due to specific institutional or cultural factors rather than essentialist arguments of women as the more ethical sex.
- There is consensus that the effects of corruption are gendered, with women thought to suffer more from the negative impacts due to the inter-related factors of higher rates of poverty, responsibility for family care, dependence on public services, and conditions of discrimination and marginalization.
- Women's greater vulnerability to sexual exploitation increases their risk for three highly gendered forms of corruption: sextortion, trafficking in persons, and sexual harassment.
- Though data is scant, women appear to report corruption less frequently than men, with gender imbalances in access to information identified as one of the limitations. Additional research is needed to ensure that whistleblower protections are designed to address the needs of women as well as men.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Argentina, Mexico, and Peru have enacted whistleblower legislation in recent years, although the legal frameworks are seen as limited and lack consistent enforcement.

# Key Questions for Gender Mainstreaming across Fund Pillars

As outlined in the IDB's Gender Policy, all IDB interventions (loans and technical cooperation) that include a gender-related result in its results matrix or that are strategically aligned with the Gender Policy—regardless of sector, type, and size—should include a gender analysis to account for the definition of the problem and solution. This analysis should be conducted during the initial stages of the project to identify any gender imbalances and their impact on project outcomes, as well as any potential gender-based risks. Project teams are responsible for this diagnosis, which can be integrated into the broader problem and beneficiary analyses. A gender analysis can draw on a number of different processes, including a desk review by the project team, in-depth studies by a specialized consultant, or stakeholder consultations.

This chapter offers a series of key questions that can apply to Fund projects across the four pillar areas.<sup>8</sup> These are consistent with the Fund's guiding principle of "targeted transparency."

# 3.1 Do Women and Men Benefit Equally from the Project and How Can We Know That?

In line with the IDB Gender Operational Guidelines, Section 4.8, which calls for the definition of gender-related results (outputs, outcomes, or inputs) and the indicators to measure them, transparency projects should consider and prioritize addressing those forms of corruption that affect women most.<sup>9</sup> For instance,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> For further resources on gender mainstreaming in project design, see Powell (2017) and UNDP (2010; 2014b).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> As detailed in Section 2, the types of corruption that may affect women disproportionately are many, including petty corruption in the delivery of services, regulations relating to the informal economy, sexual extortion, TiP, and judicial corruption on gender-based violence, land tenure, and divorce and the like.

in the citizen security sector, this could entail a focus on transparent reporting as it relates to gender-based violence (GBV) or sexual assault. Another example is a project on public investment reporting that could include the reporting of expenditures in the reproductive health sector.

In order to do this, projects require specific tools and instruments to analyze the impact of corruption from a gender perspective. In addition to the gender-related results, projects should include sex-disaggregated data—indicators and baseline data—at all levels to identify any potential gender gaps.<sup>10</sup>

### 3.2 Are Women Providing and Accessing the Information?

Transparency projects should reflect an understanding of how diverse groups make decisions in order to "tailor transparency systems to provide new facts at the time, place and in the format that will be convenient…"(Fung et al., 2007). This concept is relevant in the case of gender and transparency in a number of ways. For instance, gender disparities in internet access or digital skills can impact the ability of women to access OG data or participate in simplified e- government administrative procedures.

Beyond ensuring that women have access to information, transparency projects should also facilitate women's ability to report cases of corruption. Across pillars, projects should consider reporting mechanisms that are accessible, safe, and easy to use for men and women alike. In order to ensure that complaint mechanisms are gender responsive, it may be necessary to adjust or reinforce protection mechanisms, such as whistleblower programs.

# 3.3 Do Women Have a Voice in Decision Making? Are There Opportunities for Engaging Women's Organizations?

Transparency projects are more likely to reflect the needs of women and men alike when decision making is gender balanced. Women should have the opportunity for constructive input and influence in the identification, design, and implementation

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> As mandated by Section VI(b) of IDB (2013).

of transparency projects, including through participation in steering or oversight committees.

The engagement of women's organizations can help ensure that projects reach women and other marginalized groups. Some of the ways that women's organizations can support gender-balanced participation in anti-corruption projects include the following:

- Ensuring that transparency information reaches women. For instance, civil society organizations (CSO) can assist in the design or implementation of gender-responsive awareness campaigns.
- Ensuring that women are involved in providing data used in transparency projects. Within community-based projects, CSOs can facilitate spaces where women feel empowered to provide input relating to planning and budgeting, for instance.
- Supporting the sustainability of projects. Given the challenges associated with maintaining transparency projects—in terms of political will and the task of keeping data current—the participation of committed user groups can help to ensure that transparency projects are "more sustainable when advocacy groups have an incentive to maintain and improve them" (Fung et al., 2007).

# 3.4 Does the Project Present Gender-Based Risks?

Consistent with IDB's Gender Action Plan, project design must also consider whether the proposed activities present potential impacts for women and men. In addition to ensuring that activities comply with applicable national legislation relating to equality between men and women, design should also assess the extent to which the project poses potential gender risks.<sup>11</sup> Risk analysis is particularly critical in the following key areas (IDB, 2013):

- Economic opportunities
- Property rights
- Gender-based violence

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> For instance—as will be discussed below—AML efforts aimed at enhanced due diligence should include a gender analysis of the risks posed for women's financial inclusion.

# 3.5 Does the Project Reach Women across Social, Economic, and Ethnic/Racial Identities?

Consistent with the IDB's commitment to diversity (IDB, 2017), it is important to recognize that women's experience with corruption will vary greatly, based on factors including race, ethnicity, age, religion, and income. Vulnerability to corruption is most acute for those women who already face other types of discrimination that deprive them of political and economic power. These intersectional inequalities relate to transparency in a number of ways. Access to the internet—and by extension, OG information—varies greatly by social and economic group; for instance, as evidenced by the case of Brazil where connectivity for the richest quintile is 75 percent compared with only 5 percent for the poorest quintile (Bianchi, 2015).

Age is another factor, since a woman's level of vulnerability to corruption may vary over the course of her life. For instance, one survey found that women were most likely to report being asked for a bribe between the ages of 30 and 59 years, perhaps due to their roles as caregivers and organizers of households during that period (UNDP, 2013). Though data is scant, it is also likely that the indigenous and the African descendent population are more vulnerable to corruption and lack redress, given their higher levels of poverty and the continuing discrimination found in many contexts.

#### Summary: Key questions for mainstreaming gender in transparency projects

- Are women providing and accessing the information?
- Are there opportunities for engaging women's organizations?
- What gender-specific information is captured?
- Does the project identify gender-specific risks?
- Does the project reach women across social, economic, and ethnic/racial identities?

# Gender Mainstreaming by Transparency Fund Pillar

While the questions in Section 3 are relevant across all types of transparency projects, there are also challenges and opportunities specific to each of the four pillars. As noted below, the Fund has already integrated gender mainstreaming into some of its projects. The following section draws on IDB and Fund experiences, insights provided by IDB specialists, academic literature, and international good practices to provide examples, by pillar, of issues to consider for the promotion of transparency and gender equality.

# 4.1 Financial Integrity

#### 4.1.1 Anti-money laundering

The aim of the Fund's AML projects is to strengthen the capacity of member countries to prevent money laundering and terrorist financing. Emphasis is on the 40 recommendations of the standards for combatting money laundering and terrorist financing of the Financial Action Task Force (FATF).

### 4.1.1.1 TiP/money laundering connection

In the framework of FATF Recommendations, the Fund has supported member countries in the design and implementation of risk-based approaches to AML/ counter-terrorist financing. Of the many different types of illicit business, TiP is one of the most significant, with annual revenues estimated at US\$32 billion worldwide (Sellar, 2017).

Money laundering plays an important role in TiP operations, and international experiences demonstrate that tracking and collecting the money is one of the most effective ways to disrupt TiP criminal networks (OSCE, 2014). Such an approach requires involving AML authorities from the earliest stages of a TiP investigation

and raising awareness and/or providing training to AML authorities on TiP business models, markets, and mechanisms for moving illicit funds (Ibid.).

There are a number of FATF recommendations relevant to TiP efforts. For instance, an FATF report highlights Special Recommendations VI, VII, and IX as particularly essential to ensure that the laundering of TiP revenues are identified and seized, as well as Recommendations 13, 26, and 27 that place emphasis on the performance of financial intelligence units and quality suspicious transaction reports (FATF, 2011). Cross-border cooperation is critical in fighting money laundering associated with TiP, since the operation may involve recruiters in the country of origin, transporters who move between countries, and the exploiters within the destination country.<sup>12</sup>

As of 2017, the Fund had provided technical assistance for national risk assessments to nine countries and national action plan development in two countries (Trapnell, 2017: 53). Building on this experience, the Fund could work with member countries to integrate an analysis of TiP-derived revenues in future assessment and planning processes. The Fund may choose to prioritize those countries of origin known as sources of high proportions of TiP victims, although support can also target transport and origin countries—a list from which no country is exempt. Efforts could also focus on international cooperation relating to AML and TiP, as well as strategic investment in raising the focus of financial intelligence units in specialized TiP-related financial investigation.

#### 4.1.1.2 Financial inclusion safeguards

There is concern that AML-related requirements on financial institutions may unintentionally exclude legitimate businesses and consumers. This can happen if banks begin requiring multiple or costly forms of customer identification, or if the price of services increases, given the costs associated with meeting AML obligations. As women make up a higher percentage of the financially excluded, they are hit particularly hard by any increase in the requirements or costs.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Cross-border trafficking within LAC is significant, accounting for 22 percent of the flows detected in South America, for instance. About 40 percent of the persons convicted in countries of destination for cross-border trafficking in 2014 were not citizens of the country in which they were convicted (UNODC, 2016).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> The World Bank estimates a financial inclusion gender gap in developing countries at 9 percentage points: 59 percent of men reported having an account in 2014, compared to 50 percent of women (World Bank, 2014).

#### **Good practice**

In 2011, Mexico approved a tiered scheme for new deposit accounts that includes lower requirements for low-value accounts. These risk-based know-your-customer requirements have enabled access to low-risk accounts with maximum balance limits of approximately US\$400. According to Mexico's banking and securities regulator, the National Banking and Stocks Commission (Comisión Nacional Bancaria y de Valores, or CNVB), 6.7 million new low-risk accounts were created during the program's first year of existence. 19

Source: Lewis, Villasenor, and West (2015); Thomas and Ioannides (undated).

Consistent with the IDB's commitment to ensure safeguards to avoid adverse effects, the Fund's AML activities could work with member countries and financial institutions in developing simplified know-your-customer options, according to the profile of the prospective customer (FATF, 2013). In addition, the IDB can work with regulators to ensure penalties are defined according to the principle of proportionality, such that financial institutions are not overly risk-averse to working with smaller clients (Gelb, 2016).

### 4.2 Control Systems

Under this pillar, the Fund supports LAC member governments in improving audit and control practices through the use of (a) risk-based audit tools, (b) enhanced regulatory frameworks, (c) information-sharing systems, (d) value for money audits, and (e) dialogue and knowledge generation. The Fund has been instrumental in the adoption of existing standards, as well as improved capacity in 86 percent of countries receiving assistance (Trapnell, 2017). In particular, the Fund prioritizes projects and knowledge sharing that moves beyond more traditional regulatory or financial audits to look at economy, efficiency, and effectiveness through performance audits.

#### 4.2.1 Gender equality audits

Building on its experience in providing technical assistance for innovative audit management, the Fund could support strengthening the capacity of supreme audit institutions (SAI) to assess the extent to which governments have institutionalized gender-responsive policies, programs, and budgets. There are a number of potential 20

From 2012 to 2014, the Organization of Latin American and Caribbean Supreme Audit Institutions supported a Coordinated Audit on Gender Equality and Equity. This included the design and implementation of the following gender-responsive audits:

- Analysis of the functions of the Division of Planning, Control and Affirmative Action of the Ombudsman Office for Women by the supreme audit institution (SAI) in Puerto Rico
- Review of the Support Program for School Retention, as well as the Support Program for Adolescent Mothers by the SAI in Chile
- Analysis of compliance with the National Policy for Gender Equality and Equity (2007-17) by the SAI in Costa Rica (OLACEFS, undated)

entry points for this type of focus. For instance, the SAI could assess the government's capacity to fulfill gender-equality obligations associated with the Sustainable Development Goals. Furthermore, a SAI could apply a gender lens to the audit of a public program by examining the level of sex-disaggregated data collected and the gender differences regarding the obstacles and impacts of the program.

### 4.2.2 Gender-responsive complaint systems

Another area that could potentially fall under the pillar of control systems would be an integrated complaint system within national public administration. Such a system would include an accessible and transparent one-stop mechanism for receiving, registering, and following up on corruption reporting (La Republica, 2017). Gender mainstreaming in this context would involve the sex-disaggregated tracking of complaints and type of resolution to ensure that women are fully able to take advantage of the system. Procedures and whistleblower protections would also necessarily include the highly gendered areas of sexual harassment and sex-based discrimination.

International experience in the security sector provides a number of good practices for ensuring that complaint systems are gender-responsive such as Bastick (2014; 2015):

- Information regarding the complaints procedure displayed in government offices and other community areas, and provided to women's organizations
- Multiple ways to lodge complaints, including using a toll-free number, text, or by email

- Female staff member available to take complaints from a woman or girl
- Requirements stipulating that no staff may refuses a complaint or attempt to dissuade a person from filing a complaint
- Records systems that identify whether the complainant has any relationship with the alleged abuser
- Possibility of making a complaint in one's own language
- Procedures to allow a complainant to lodge an anonymous complaint;
- Possibility of a complaint being made by a victim's partner, family member, friend, or other representative
- System whereby traceable and confidential records are kept of all complaints made
- Whistleblower protections, including from reprimand or dismissal during the complaints process

# 4.3 Natural Resource Governance

Under this pillar, the Fund focuses on enhancing transparency and access to information on the benefits and impacts of the extractive industries (EI). The five activity areas under this include (a) diagnostics and work plans to implement transparency standards, such as the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI); (b) use of software to publish information on the benefits and impacts; (c) support for public education campaigns; (d) support for the review of legal codes, laws, and contracts relating to transparency; and (e) knowledge generation and dissemination on transparency in EI.<sup>14</sup>

# 4.3.1 Gender-smart contract negotiations

In line with the Fund's focus on the review of legal codes, laws, and contracts, support could be provided to ensure that member country contract negotiations are gender smart as well as transparent. This could include, for instance, local content policies with gender equality targets, quotas for women's participation in community-based negotiating and monitoring committees, and community investment activities that enhance the capacity of women-owned businesses (Scott et al., 2013).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Though the IDB has not engaged in work relating to informal or illegal mining to date, it should be noted that both have gender dimensions that would require attention.

# 4.3.2 Analyses and mapping of extractive industry impacts

In Colombia, the Fund supported the creation of MapaRegalias for visualization of geo-referenced information showing the sources and uses of royalty income. Building on this experience, the Fund could support a gendered mapping of the benefits and impacts of EI-derived investments, in consultation with community and CSOs, and then presented visually through a specially tailored MapaImpactos tool.

### 4.3.3 Gender planning for the use of extractive industry revenue

The Fund has supported planning for improved EI revenue management in 10 countries, including commitments relating to revenue allocation (Trapnell, 2017). Based on these experiences, the Fund could support capacity for EI revenue allocation that is transparent and gendered to ensure that EI resources meet the needs of women and men alike. The Fund could also promote the inclusion of women in the country's EITI multi-stakeholder groups and in the oversight of the implementation of this initiative.

# 4.4 Open Government

Within this pillar, the Fund supports projects aimed at improving the capacity of national and subnational governments to create and maintain platforms for stakeholder collaboration, aimed at enhancing public services and improving accountability. Key activity areas include (a) provision of transparent and accessible information; (b) citizen participation in the design, implementation, and monitoring of public services; (c) e-government solutions for enhanced services; (d) transparency in procurement, budget execution, and civil service; and (e) application of public ethics standards and strengthened parliaments.

#### **Good practice**

The Indian Ministry of New and Renewable Energy carried out a gender audit in 2008, in consultation with women's organizations, civil society groups, the media, and other stake-holders. The study found that modern renewable energy projects did not sufficiently bene-fit women, nor did they collect sex-disaggregated data. Through the process, stakeholders gained an essential understanding of the energy sector and data for its improvement.

Source: Agora (undated).

### 4.4.1 Open Government Partnership compliance

OGP membership includes 70 national governments and 15 subnational governments. Experts have identified a number of OGP gender gaps: less than 5 percent of national OGP action plans have commitments specific to gender, and women are underrepresented in national OGP committees (OPG, 2016). Given these imbalances, the Fund could build on its experience thus far, working with LAC countries in planning and/or implementing OGP commitments (Trapnell 2017: 78) to provide advisory support for gender-specific commitments, particularly in relation to the provision of information relating to specific sectors, such as access to justice, reproductive and sexual health rights, social welfare subsidies, services, and the informal economy. Efforts should also aim to increase the participation of women (and women's organizations) in national committees as well as promote specially targeted communication campaigns to ensure women are informed of the OGP process.

#### 4.4.2 E-government

In Uruguay, the Fund has supported the digitalization and simplification of 46 administrative processes. Of these, 10 (including on issues such as domestic violence reporting, mental health support, health emergency services, and consultation and guidance for victims of violence) were estimated to be focused on women's needs and interests.<sup>15</sup> Future projects could include gender equality as criteria to determine which services should be prioritized for simplification. Design should also take into account gender differences in internet access or the establishment of e-service centers that are safe and accessible for women's use. Finally, as part of the IDB's commitment to safeguards, projects should consider the extent to which administrative simplification may make certain jobs redundant, as well as any potential impact on women's public sector employment.

#### 4.4.3 Gender-responsive budgeting

Budget cuts and allocations can have acutely different impacts on men and women. Research in the United Kingdom, for instance, found that women bore 85 percent of the costs of austerity cuts, and that diverting investments from construction to the care sector would generate 1.5 million jobs instead of 750,000 (The Economist, 23

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Interview with Nicolas Dassen, Senior Specialist of the IDB and Team Leader of the Modernization of the State project (UR-T1122).

#### **Good practice**

There are a number of parliamentary experiences in gender-responsive legislative analysis. In Sweden, the annual budget bill has become a "high profile and much anticipated document," showing how allocations are distributed between men and women and the impact of social programs on closing the gender gap. In Spain, budgets submitted to parliament are accompanied by a gender impact assessment in compliance with the Law 30/2003.a The Mexican Parliament's Center for Women's Advancement is a nonpartisan research body, charged with reviewing bills from a gender perspective and providing technical assistance to parliamentarians on the design of gender-sensitive analysis.

Sources: Palmieri (2011); Juberto and O'Hagan (2010).

<sup>a</sup> Law regarding actions to incorporate an assessment of the gender impact of regulatory measures elaborated by the government (Ley sobre medidas para incorporar la valoración del impacto de género en las disposiciones normativas que elabore el Gobierno).

2017). Providing budget analysis that is nonpartisan, transparent, and gendered can enhance the quality of legislation and contribute to greater gender equality.

Building on IDB support in Argentina for improved technical analysis of budgets, the Fund could support the development of procedures and criteria for gender-responsive budget analysis, designed to outline the projected differentiated impacts of legislation on men and women. Along similar lines, Fund support could focus on government departments for enhanced gender analysis and reporting on budget allocations, using sex-disaggregated performance indicators.

# 4.4.4 Information and communications technology: policy and innovation

A recent report on corruption in Latin America recommends "democratizing access to new information technologies," given the critical role that the internet and social media play in promoting transparency and accountability (Casas-Zamora and Carter, 2017: 45). This emphasis is consistent with the Fund's considerable investments in promoting innovation and e-government services. Unless the LAC region's digital divide is addressed, however, these programs risk reinforcing existing gender inequalities. Improvements in national ICT policies could enhance women's equal access to information. In this regard, the Fund could consider supporting transparent monitoring of gender equality in the implementation of ICT strategies through the inclusion of sex-disaggregated data collection, the creation of review commissions—consisting of the government, private sector, and CSOs (including women's

#### **Good practice**

The Information and Communication Technologies for Development in the Arab Region initiative supports the development of e-government services for improved accountability, efficiency, and service quality. The Initiative includes a dedicated gender service that focuses on the provision of legal information on women's rights, as well as capacity-building activities to enhance digital skills.

Source: UNDP (2005).

groups)—and the establishment of processes for periodic review. Similarly, programs focused on encouraging transparency-related innovations could prioritize gender equality through incentives or awards for projects benefitting women and girls (Kenny and O'Donnell, 2017).

### 4.4.5 Leveling the procurement playing field

Policies that combine transparency and gender equality in public procurement processes can be mutually reinforcing and result in women's inclusion and lower costs. For instance, simplified processes have the potential to reduce opportunities for corruption and make it easier for women to participate. At the same time, proactive efforts to increase the gender awareness of government procurement officers, increase information provided to women entrepreneurs, and enhance women's capacity to compete are important tools in leveling the playing field and ensuring bidder diversification. With this in mind, the Fund could build on efforts of the IDB's Fiscal and Municipal Management Division to conduct assessments on procurement practices—including transparency, gender inclusiveness, and digital technologies—and develop toolkits and training for procurement officers accordingly.

#### **Good practice**

Chile and the Dominican Republic have worked to expand competition in public procurement processes by providing support and incentives aimed at increasing the number of women suppliers. The Dominican Republic program stipulates a 20-percent quota for women-owned micro-, small-, and medium-sized businesses. ChileCompra includes the application of a transparent certification mechanism (Sello Empresa Mujer) for women-owned businesses and their inclusion in public databases.

### 4.4.6 Civil service diagnostics

The IDB has supported a number of comprehensive diagnostic analyses of central government civil services for more effective strategic resource planning and management. Ensuring that civil service workforce data are collected and made publicly available also promotes accountability and decision making, based on considerations of merit (OECD, 2017). To ensure that hiring, promotion, compensation, and retention are gender equitable, the Fund could support the collection, analysis, and publication of sex-disaggregated data. These workforce analyses would also provide a basis for gender-equality benchmarking. In addition, IDB support for analyses and designs of early retirement policies and packages is another key area for sex-disaggregated data collection and analysis to identify any gender-based risks and to contribute to gender responsive workforce planning and restructuring.

#### 4.4.7 Community mapping

The Fund has supported participatory geo-mapping of informal settlement communities in Argentina and Guyana. Information collected is used to support transparent decision-making processes relating to subsidies for home improvements. In the long term, the information will serve also to inform the development of subnational and national housing policies. Projects such as this have a number of gender dimensions that should be considered for future project design and implementation. First, the community participation component should be structured, such that women are fully empowered to provide data and contribute to the decision-making process. As feasible, participation could be structured along the lines of a citizen report card (Björkman and Jakob Svensson, 2007). Second, the subsidy criteria should be designed to promote gender equality or, at a minimum, avoid reinforcing already existing imbalances. Notably, the project does prioritize subsidy support for single-parent homes. Conversely, the subsidy's ownership requirement may work against gender equality, as women are more likely to rent their homes. Finally, throughout the project, sex disaggregation of indicators will be critical.

#### 4.4.8 Performance monitoring

Within the OG pillar, the Fund has worked to mainstream transparency in sectors—including education, health, and land management—for improved service delivery, greater cost efficiency, and reduced opportunities for corruption. Integrating a gender equality focus within these mainstreaming efforts can help to ensure that the programs are responsive to the needs of women and men. For instance, the IDB's support for a report on *The State of Social Housing in Six Caribbean Countries*
#### **Good practice**

In a number of cities around the world, online platforms have been developed that allow women to anonymously report harassment or unsafe conditions. These include HarassTracker in Lebanon and HarassMap in Egypt. As demonstrated by Safecity in India, information collected can be used by citizens to prioritize and pressure local authorities for needed improvements, including better lighting, more police presence, and public messaging, particularly in areas that are insecure (Singh, 2018). 27

(McHardy and Donovan, 2016) includes a review of housing incentives as it relates to transparency (Trapnell, 2017). If this research were to incorporate gender analysis—including sex-disaggregated data on who benefits from housing policies—policy measures could be designed to ensure that women do not face disproportionate barriers in terms of access criteria, input into policy design, or complaints reporting in case of inefficiencies or corruption.

## 4.4.9 FixMyStreet Initiatives

In Uruguay, the Fund has supported PorMiBarrio (PorMiBarrio.uy) which allows citizens to communicate directly with their municipal governments via mobile phones or computers, and to report street damage, sanitation problems, vandalism or other local issues. Just as importantly, the portal allows citizens to monitor municipal responses to the complaints. Building on this initiative, the Fund could support gender mainstreaming innovations.

First, in the spirit of targeted transparency, the project could analyze who is using the service, either by asking citizens to specify their sex when filing a report, or through public surveys. Moreover, the service could partner with women's organizations to better promote its use by women. Finally, the initiative could allow for feedback on public services, especially those heavily used by women (e.g., health or education) or allow women (and men) to report areas where they face harassment or feel unsafe.

## 4.4.10 Improved case management and transparency in the judicial branch

Building on current IDB efforts in Peru,<sup>16</sup> the Fund could support automated case management systems for GBV cases through simplified processes and enhanced

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> The IDB supports the efforts of the Government of Peru to improve its GBV response capacity through enhanced inter-agency case registration and monitoring.

inter-institutional coordination. The use of an integrated case management system, to be used across agencies, could remove opportunities for corruption through the safeguarding of documents, closer scrutiny of processes, and standardization of court fees.

These simplified case management processes could also contribute to improved transparency in the judicial branch, where the OG movement has gained little traction to date.<sup>17</sup> The Fund could consider supporting the OG agenda with a focus on gender issues (e.g., GBV) and defining the types of information to be made available in open formats, including court rulings and statistics on case resolution, disaggregated by type of court and judge, among others. Another potential area of support is the online platforms that GBV victims are able to access for up-to-date information on their cases, as has been developed in Argentina, Chile, and Colombia (Elena, 2015).

## 4.5 Sextortion: An Emerging Area

Combining elements of corruption and sexual exploitation, sextortion defies easy legal definitions, measurements, and solutions. Although sextortion does not fit neatly into any of the Fund's current four pillars, its devastating impacts and invisibility make transparency an imperative. Some areas for exploration include the following.

## 4.5.1 Data collection and research

Although this form of abuse of authority is an age-old issue, its dimensions are unknown. Some research has been carried out in Africa (Leach et al., 2003; Zicherman, 2006), although the forms and dimensions of sextortion in Latin America are underexplored. Surveys, such as the Corruption Perception Index of Transparency International, currently lack sextortion-specific questions. Research could include the design or adaptation of data collection and monitoring tools that capture sextortion victimization.

## 4.5.2 Legal framework review and reform

As a form of corruption, where the currency is sex rather than money, anticorruption statutes do not generally cover sextortion abuse. At the same time, the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> One positive example is in Argentina, where the justice system has developed an electronic platform with some court decisions, and where the Supreme Court has committed to using new technologies to improve justice services.



focus of GBV laws on physical violence or force may miss sextortion cases, which rely primarily on the coercive power of authority (IAWJ, 2012). As a key initial step toward ensuring greater transparency regarding sextortion cases, the Fund could support a review of current legal frameworks, their compatibility with international law, and the priorities for reform.

### 4.5.3 Codes of conduct

Building on its extensive experience in drafting and implementing new codes of conduct, including with 255 public agencies in Chile (Trapnell, 2017: 80), the Fund could work with member countries to review and amend government agency ethical rules or codes of professional conduct for the inclusion of sextortion abuse.

### 4.5.4 Awareness raising and complaints mechanisms

Once there is an improved understanding of the challenges within a specific country or region, the Fund could consider support for awareness raising activities, such that "people recognize that the problem exists, that the conduct is wrong, and that there is a remedy available." (IAWJ, 2012: 32). Building on its experience in developing an electronic complaints mechanism relating to public health service delivery (Trapnell, 2017: 91), the Fund could explore options for broadening systems to ensure safe spaces for reporting sextortion abuse and to raise awareness regarding their existence.

#### **Good practices**

Focusing on the smallest administrative unit (barangay) in the country where sextortion victims might first turn for assistance, judges in the Philippines organized seminars to build the capacity of barangay leaders to deal with sextortion complaints more effectively. In Tanzania, judges organized training with nonjudicial personnel in all of the country's High Court Centers to educate them about sextortion and what to do if they encounter it.

Sources: IAWJ (2012).

# Monitoring and Evaluation

This section includes a series of cross-cutting gender mainstreaming indicators for consideration within projects supported by the Fund. In addition, there are indicators, specified by pillar, to guide project teams in evaluating their portfolios and prioritizing new projects. Table 2 is only for illustrative purposes, as measurements must be tailored to the specific project and contexts. For those project results that are measured in terms of number of individuals, indicators should be disaggregated by sex. All indicators should also include a baseline.

## Table 2. Cross-Cutting Indicators for Project Design

#### Indicator (in percent)

- · People providing input/information who are women/men
- · Users of the information who are women/men
- · People who register complaints who are women/men
- · Transparency-related awareness campaigns that include special measures to reach women
- Knowledge resources that include gender analysis

Indicators b	by pillar to guide identification and development of projects
Financial Integrity	In percent:
	Anti-money laundering (AML): national risk assessments that include analysis of TiP-derived revenues     AML national action place that include TiP related measures
	<ul> <li>AML national action plans that include TiP-related measures</li> <li>AML national risk assessments that include analysis of financial exclusion risks</li> </ul>
	<ul> <li>AML national action plans that incorporate measures that reduce risks of over- compliance and create incentives for providers willing to offer lower-risk products and services</li> </ul>

(continued on next page)

## Table 2. (continued) **Cross-Cutting Indicators for Project Design** Indicators by pillar to guide identification and deve

indicators by	pillar to guide identification and development of projects
Control Systems	<ul> <li>Number of performance audits undertaken by supreme audit institutions that are gender sensitive, including sex-disaggregated data and analysis of the program's gendered obstacles and impacts</li> <li>Number of audits carried out of policies or programs that address Sustainable Development Goal #51</li> <li>Percent of supreme audit institution counterparts that receive capacity building for gender-sensitive auditing</li> <li>Percent of complaint systems that include sex-disaggregated tracking of complaint and resolution</li> <li>Percent of complaints systems that incorporate measures aimed to enhance information/accessibility for women</li> </ul>
Natural	In percent:
Resource Governance	<ul> <li>Pre-project feasibility studies that include gender-sensitive analysis of expected impacts, including on topics such as prostitution, family abandonment, and gender-based violence (GBV)</li> <li>Post-project extractive-industry-related investment mapping that includes gender-sensitive analysis of impacts</li> </ul>
Open	In percent:
Government	<ul> <li>Open Government Partnership action plans that include commitments specific to gende</li> <li>Women/men in open government national committees</li> <li>Open government national committees that include women's organizations</li> <li>Digitalized/simplified administrative processes that focus on women's needs and in terests</li> <li>Budget processes that include gender-responsive analysis</li> <li>National information and communication technology policies that include gender equality analysis and targets</li> <li>National/subnational procurement policies that include measures aimed to promote the enhancement of women's participation</li> <li>Government procurement officers who receive gender awareness training</li> <li>Civil service workforce assessments that include sex-disaggregated data and gender-sensitive analysis</li> <li>Civil service retirement analyses that include sex-disaggregated data and analysis or gender-based risks</li> <li>Community mapping exercises that include gender targets for community participation sex-disaggregated data collection, and gender-sensitive analysis of risks and impacts</li> <li>Citizen report card processes that are gender sensitive in terms of focusing on programs that are particularly relevant to women's needs; incorporating women's participation; and including gender analysis of impacts</li> <li>Justice systems improving quantity/quality of publicly available data regarding GB<sup>1</sup> cases</li> </ul>

(continued on next page)

## Table 2. (continued) Cross-Cutting Indicators for Project Design

Indicators by pillar to guide identification and development of projects			
Open Government	Number of the following:		
	<ul> <li>Assessments of governmental action to address GBV ; and</li> <li>Governments (national/subnational) that carry out automated case management of GBV cases.</li> </ul>		
Sextortion	In percent:		
	<ul> <li>Transparency-related survey tools that incorporate questions aimed at detecting sextortion</li> <li>Codes of conduct that explicitly address sextortion</li> <li>Complaint mechanisms reviewed and reformed (if necessary) to capture sextortion cases</li> </ul>		
	Number of the following:		
	<ul> <li>Member countries carrying out legal framework reform to address sextortion</li> <li>Countries carrying out sextortion awareness raising campaigns</li> </ul>		

## References

- Agora. Undated. Parliamentary Action on Gender and Renewable Energy: Financing Gender Mainstreaming. Module 4. Agora-parl.orgl. Available at www.agora-parl. org/toolkit/gender/module4\_1.
- Alhassan-Alolo, N. 2007. Gender and Corruption: Testing the New Consensus. Public Administration and Development, 27(3): 227–237. doi:10.1002/pad.455.
- Alatas, V. et al. 2009. Gender, Culture, and Corruption: Insights from an Experimental Analysis. Southern Economic Journal 75(3): 663-680.
- Asiedu, Edward. 2016. Coming Home without Supplies: Impact of Household Needs on Bribe Involvement and Gender Gaps. GlobalFood Discussion Papers, No. 75. Available at www.econstor.eu/bitstream/10419/125781/1/845395130.pdf.
- Bastick, Megan. 2014. Integrating Gender into Oversight of the Security Sector by Ombuds Institutions & National Human Rights Institutions. Geneva: Democratic Control of Armed Forces, Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, and Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. Available at www.osce.org/ odihr/118327?download=true.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 2015. Gender and Complaints Mechanisms: A Handbook for Armed Forces and Ombuds Institutions. Geneva: Centre for the Democratic Control of Armed Forces. Available at www.files.ethz.ch/isn/194726/DCAF-Handbook-Gender-Complaints-Mechanisms.pdf.
- Bauhr, M. 2012. Need or Greed Corruption. In Holmberg, S. & Rothstein, B. (eds.) Good Government. The Relevance of Political Science. London: Edward Elgar Publishing.
- Bauhr, Monika and Lena Wängnerud. 2016. Inclusion or Exclusion? Gender Difference in Mobilization against Greed Corruption. Paper presented at the Gender and Corruption Workshop of The Quality of Government Institute, May 23-24, 2016.
- Bianchi, Matias. 2015. Digital Age Inequality in Latin America. Open Democracy, June 24. Available at www.opendemocracy.net/democraciaabierta/mat%C3%ADasbianchi/digital-age-inequality-in-latin-america.

- Bird, Lucia and Nils Krauer, 2017. Case Study: Illicit Gold Mining in Peru. Geneva: The Global Initiative against Transnational Organized Crime. Available at http://globalinitiative.net/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/TGIATOC-Case-Study-Peru-1878-web-lo-res.pdf.
- Björkman Martina and Jakob Svensson. 2007. Power to the People: Evidence from a Randomized Field Experiment of a Community-Based Monitoring Project in Uganda. Policy Research Working Paper 4268. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/7447.
- Boehm, Frédéric and Erika Sierra. 2015. The Gendered Impact of Corruption: Who Suffers More—Men or Women? U4 Brief, August 2015:9. Bergen: Chris. Michelsen Institute and U4. Available at www.u4.no/publications/thegendered-impact-of-corruption-who-suffers-more-men-or-women/pdf.
- Cap-Net, GWA (Gender and Water Alliance). 2014. Why Gender Matters in IWRM: A Tutorial for Water Managers. Full resource document. Available at www. thewaterchannel.tv/gender/content/img/frd-full-resource-document-webversion.pdf.
- Casas-Zamora, Kevin and Miguel Carter. 2017. Beyond the Scandals: The Changing Context of Corruption in Latin America. Rule of Law Report. Washington, DC: Inter-American Dialogue. Available at www.thedialogue.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/Corruption-in-Latin-America\_ROL\_Report\_FINAL\_web-PDF.pdf.
- Dassen, Nicolás and Juan Cruz Vieyra (Eds). 2012. Open Government and Targeted Transparency: Trends and Challenges for Latin America and the Caribbean. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank. Available at https:// publications.iadb.org/bitstream/handle/11319/3198/Open%20Government%20 and%20Targeted%20Transparency:%20Trends%20and%20Challenges%20 for%20Latin%20America%20and%20the%20Caribbean.pdf?sequence=1.
- Dollar, D., R. Fisman, and R. Gatti. 1999. Are Women Really the "Fairer" Sex? Corruption and Women in Government. PRR Gender and Development Working Paper No.4. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at http://siteresources. worldbank.org/INTGENDER/Resources/wp4.pdf.
- Elena, Sandra. 2015. Open Data for Open Justice: A Case Study of the Judiciaries of Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Costa Rica, Mexico, Peru and Uruguay. Center for the Implementation of Public Policies Promoting Equity and Growth, Open Data Research Symposium, held on May 27 in Ottawa, Canada. Available at www.opendataresearch.org/dl/symposium2015/odrs2015-paper10.pdf.
- Ellis, A., C. Manuel, and M. Blackden. 2006. Gender and Economic Growth in Uganda: Unleashing the Power of Women. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTAFRREGTOPGENDER/Resources/ gender\_econ\_growth\_ug.pdf.

- Esarey, J. and G. Chirillo. 2013. "Fairer Sex" or Purity Myth? Corruption, Gender, and Institutional Context. Politics & Gender, 9: 361-389.
- FATF (Financial Action Task Force). 2011. Money Laundering Risks Arising from Trafficking in Human Beings and Smuggling of Migrants. Paris: Financial Action Task Force and Organization for Co-operation and Economic Development. Available at www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/Trafficking%20 in%20Human%20Beings%20and%20Smuggling%20of%20Migrants.pdf.
- . 2013. Guidance on Anti-Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing Measures and Financial Inclusion. Paris: Financial Action Task Force and Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. Available at www. fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/AML\_CFT\_Measures\_and\_ Financial\_Inclusion\_2013.pdf.
- Fung, Archon, Mary Graham, and David Weil. 2007. Full Disclosure: The Perils and Promise of Transparency. Cambridge University Press.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Mary Graham, David Weil, and Elena Fagotto. 2007. Transparency Policies: Two Possible Futures. *Taubman Center Policy Briefs*, PB-2007-1. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University.
- GCB (Global Corruption Barometer). 2007. (Online). Berlin: Transparency International. Available at www.transparency.org/whatwedo/publication/gcb\_2007.
- Gelb, Alan. 2016. Balancing Financial Integrity with Financial Inclusion: The Risk-Based Approach to "Know Your Customer". CGD Policy Paper 074. Washington DC: Center for Global Development. Available at www.cgdev.org/sites/default/ files/CGD-Policy-Paper-Gelb-KYC-Financial-Inclusion.pdf.
- Goetz, A. M. 2007. Political Cleaners: Women as the New Anti-Corruption Force? Development and Change, 38(1): 87–105.
- Grimes, Marcia and Lena Wängnerud. 2016. Gender and Corruption: A Theory of Conditioned Causality. Paper presented at the Gender and Corruption Workshop of The Quality of Government Institute, May 23-24, 2016. In Work Package: WP11 Building Accountability: Transparency, Civil Society and Administrative Responses.
- IDB (Inter-American Development Bank). 2013. Implementation Guidelines for the Operational Policy on Gender Equality in Development. Gender and Diversity Section, Social Sector. Washington, DC: Inter-American

Development Bank. Available at http://services.iadb.org/wmsfiles/products/ Publications/38154638.pdf.

- —. 2016. Transparency Fund (AAF: Annual Report 2016. Office of Outreach and Partnerships, Grants and Co-Financing Management Unit, Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank.
- —. 2017a. Gender Diversity. Sector Framework Document. Gender and Diversity Division. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank. Available at www.iadb.org/document.cfm?id=EZSHARE-1024040741-40.
- . 2017b. Toolkit for Mainstreaming Gender in MIF Projects. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank. Available at https://publications.iadb.org/ bitstream/handle/11319/8176/Toolkit-for-Mainstreaming-Gender-in-MIF-Projects.pdf?sequence=1.
- . [undated]. Transparency Fund 2013-2018: Strategic Approach and Results Framework 2013-2018. IDB Partnerships. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank. Available at http://idbdocs.iadb.org/wsdocs/getdocument. aspx?docnum=39377028.
- IAWJ (International Association of Women Judges). 2012. Stopping the Abuse of Power through Sexual Exploitation: Naming, Shaming, and Ending Sextortion. Washington, DC: International Association of Women Judges. Available at www.iawj.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/04/Corruption-and-Sextortion-Resource-1.pdf.
- Jajkowicz, O. and A. Drobistzova. 2015. The Effect of Corruption on Government Expenditure Allocation in OECD Countries. Acta Universitatis Agriculturae et Silviculturae Mendelianae Brunensis, Vol. 63, 138(4): 1251-1259. Available at https://acta.mendelu.cz/media/pdf/actaun\_2015063041251.pdf.
- Jubeto, Yolanda and Angela O'Hagan. 2010. Gender Budgeting: Proposal to the European Union Institutions on the Added Value of Introducing Gender-Based Analysis in the Budgetary Policy of the European Union and its Member States. Madrid: Ministry of Equality, Government of Spain. Available at www. igualdadenlaempresa.es/recursos/monograficos/docs/6\_Gender\_Budgeting\_ Yolanda\_Jubeto\_EME-1.pdf.
- Kenny Charles and Megan O'Donnell. 2017. Expanding Women's Role in Developing Technology: Increasing Productivity, Improving Lives. CGD Notes. Washington, DC: Center for Global Development. Available at www.cgdev.org/sites/default/ files/expanding-womens-role-developing-technology.pdf.
- La Republica. 2017. "Controloria propone sistema integrado de denuncias para toda la administracion publica." 8 December. Politica, Grupo La Republica. Available

at http://larepublica.pe/politica/1155328-contraloria-propone-sistema-integrado-de-denuncias-para-toda-la-administracion-publica.

- Leach, Fiona et al. 2003. "An Investigative Study of the Abuse of Girls in African Schools." Education Papers 12849. London: Department for International Development. Available at https://ageconsearch.umn.edu/bitstream/12849/1/ er030054.pdf.
- Levinson, Meridith. 2008. "Whistleblowers: Women Experience More Retaliation than Men. Study Reports." May 8. CIO magazine www.cio.com/article/2436408/ morale/whistleblowers--women-experience-more-retaliation-than-men-study-reports.html.
- Lewis, Robin, John Villasenor, Darrell M. West. 2015. Financial Inclusion in Latin America: Regulatory Trends and Market Opportunities. Techtank. Part of a series of the 2015 Brookings Financial and Digital Inclusion Project (FDIP) Report and Scorecard. Brookings Institution, October 29. Available at www. brookings.edu/blog/techtank/2015/10/29/financial-inclusion-in-latinamerica-regulatory-trends-and-market-opportunities/.
- Lim, Lin Lean . 1996. More and Better Jobs for Women. An Action Guide. An ILO Follow-up to the Fourth World Conference on Women and the World Summit for Social Development. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- McHardy, Pauline and Michael G. Donovan. 2016. The State of Social Housing in Six CaribbeanCountries.Washington,DC:Inter-AmericanDevelopmentBank.Available at https://publications.iadb.org/bitstream/handle/11319/7514/The-State-of-Social-Housing-in-Six-Caribbean-Countries.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.
- Neuman, Laura. 2016. The Right of Access to Information: Exploring Gender Inequities. Institute of Development Studies, 47(1). Available at http://bulletin. ids.ac.uk/idsbo/article/view/38/html.
- Nordic Consulting Group. 2009. A Gender Analysis of Corruption Forms, Effects on Eradication Strategies: Case Studies among the Poor in Urban and Post Conflict Settings. Research carried out for the Royal Danish Embassy, Uganda.
- OECD (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development). 2017. Government at a Glance 2017: Highlights. Paris: Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development. Available at www.oecd.org/gov/governmentat-a-glance-2017-highlights-en.pdf.
- OLACEFS. Undated. Coordinated Audit on the Subject of Gender Equality Performed by the Supreme Audit Institutions (SAI) of Puerto Rico, Chile and Costa Rica. Available at www.olacefs.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Informe\_ Ge%CC%81nero\_Ingle%CC%81s.pdf.

Open Government Partnership. 2016. Great Ideas for OGP Action Plans. Guatemala/ Liberia. Post of 8 March. Available at www.opengovpartnership.org/stories/ great-ideas-ogp-action-plans-open-government-whom-committing-women.

- OSCE (Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe). 2014. Leveraging Anti-Money Laundering Regimes to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings. Vienna: Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe. Available at www.osce.org/secretariat/121125?download=true.
- Palmieri, Sonia. 2011. Gender-Sensitive Parliaments: A Global Review of Good Practice. Reports and Document No. 65 – 2011. Geneva: Inter-Parliamentary Union. Available at http://archive.ipu.org/pdf/publications/gsp11-e.pdf.
- Powell, Alice. 2017. Integrating a Gender Perspective into Transparency and Accountability Initiatives: Three Case Studies, Gender & Development, 25:3: 489-507, DOI: 10.1080/13552074.2017.1379774. Available at www.oxfam. org.au/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/Gender-and-Development-Journal-Integrating-a-gender-perspective-into-transparency-and-accountabilityinitiatives-three-case-studies.pdf.
- Pring, Corale. 2017. People and Corruption Latin America and the Caribbean. Berlin: Transparency International. Available at www.transparency.org/whatwedo/ publication/global\_corruption\_barometer\_people\_and\_corruption\_latin\_ america\_and\_the\_car.
- Rheinbay, Janna and Marie Chêne. 2016. Gender and Corruption Topic Guide. Berlin: Transparency International. Available at www.transparency.org/files/content/ corruptionqas/Topic\_guide\_gender\_corruption\_Final\_2016.pdf.
- Rivas, M. F. 2008. An Experiment on Corruption and Gender. Working Paper (ThE Papers from Department of Economic Theory and Economic History of the University of Granada, No. 08/10). Available at www.ugr.es/~teoriahe/RePEc/ gra/wpaper/thepapers08\_10.pdf.
- Scott, Jen, Rose Dakin, Katherine Heller, and Adriana Eftimie. 2013. Extracting Lessons on Gender in the Oil and Gas Sector: A Survey and Analysis of the Gendered Impacts of Onshore Oil and Gas Production in Three Developing Countries. Extractive Industries for Development Series No. 28. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/ en/266311468161347063/pdf/798940NWP0280E0Box0379795B00PUB-LIC0.pdf.
- Sellar. 2017. John, Human Rights in a Hostile Environment. Blog. Initiative Against Transnational Organized Crime. Available at http://globalinitiative.net/programs/human/.

- 41
- Singh, Maanvi. 2018. "Apps Let Women Say #MeToo About Street Harassment." Washington, DC: National Public Radio. January 11. Available at www.npr. org/sections/goatsandsoda/2018/01/11/577154367/apps-let-women-saymetoo-about-street-harassment.
- Steiner, Jacob. 2017. Petty Corruption Isn't Petty. The Global Anti-Corruption Blog,
  29 December. Available at https://globalanticorruptionblog.com/2017/12/29/
  petty-corruption-isnt-petty/#more-11003.
- Stensöta, H., L. Wängnerud, and R. Svensson. 2015. Gender and Corruption: The Mediating Power of Institutional Logics. *Governance*, 28(4): 475–496.
- Swamy, A., S. Knack, Y. Lee, and O. Azfar. 2001. Gender and Corruption. Journal of Development Economics. 64(1): 25–55.
- Sundström, A and Wängnerud, L. 2016. Corruption as an Obstacle to Women's Political Representation: Evidence from Local Councils in 18 European Countries. Party Politics, 22(3): pp.354-369. Available at http://journals. sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1354068814549339.
- Sung, H.E. 2012. Women in Government, Public Corruption, and Liberal Democracy. A Panel Analysis." Crime, Law and Social Change, 58(3): 195–219.
- TGI (The Global Initiative). 2017. Case Study: Illicit Gold Mining in Peru. Geneva: The Global Initiative against Transnational Organized Crime. Available at http://globalinitiative.net/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/TGIATOC-Case-Study-Peru-1878-web-lo-res.pdf.
- The Economist. 2017. "Tax is a Feminist Issue: Why National Budgets Need to Take Gender into Account." February 23. Available at www.economist.com/news/ finance-and-economics/21717404-designing-fiscal-policies-support-genderequality-good-growth-why.
- Thomas, James and Emmanuel Ioannides. Undated. Balancing Act. Opinion: Financial Inclusion. Available at www.afi-global.org/sites/default/files/publications/ incompliance\_financial\_inclusion\_article.pdf.
- Thompson Reuters Foundation. 2015. Combating Sextortion: A Comparative Study of Laws to Prosecute Corruption Involving Sexual Exploitation. Thompson Reuters in partnership with International Association of Women Judges and Marval O'Farrell & Mairal. Available at www.trust.org/contentAsset/rawdata/588013e6-2f99-4d54-8dd8-9a65ae2e0802/file.
- TI (Transparency International). 2007. Gender and Corruption: Understanding and Undoing the Linkages, Working Paper 03/2007. Berlin: Transparency International. Available at http://unpan1.un.org/intradoc/groups/public/documents/ un-dpadm/unpan044385.pdf.

... 2010. Corruption and Gender in Service Delivery: The Unequal Impacts. Working Paper 02/2010. Berlin: Transparency International. Available at https:// www.transparency.org/whatwedo/publication/working\_paper\_02\_2010\_ corruption\_and\_gender\_in\_service\_delivery\_the\_unequal.

- \_\_\_\_\_\_. 2013. Whistleblowing in Europe: Legal Protections for Whistleblowers in the EU. Berlin: Transparency International. Available at www.transparency. org/whatwedo/publication/whistleblowing\_in\_europe\_legal\_protections\_for\_ whistleblowers\_in\_the\_eu.
- \_\_\_\_\_ . 2015. Women's Experience of Corruption: Lessons from Two Unions in Bangladesh. Bangladesh: Transparency International.
- Transparency Rwanda. (Undated). Gender Based Corruption in Workplaces in Rwanda. Kigali: Transparency Rwanda. Available at https://www.transparency. org/news/pressrelease/20110811\_rwandan\_workplaces.
- Trapnell, Stephanie. 2017. Transparency Fund: Review of Results (2007–17). Discussion Paper No. IDB-DP-554. Washington, DC: Inter-American Development Bank. Available at https://publications.iadb.org/bitstream/ handle/11319/8710/Review-of-Transparency-Fund-Results-2007–2017. PDF?sequence=1&isAllowed=y.
- UNDP (United Nations Development Programme). 2005. Evaluation of UNDP's Cooperation Framework for the Arab States (2002-2005). New York: United Nations Development Programme. Available at http://web.undp.org/ evaluation/evaluations/documents/RCF\_Evaluation\_RBAS.pdf.
- . 2008. Tackling Corruption, Transforming Lives: Accelerating Human Development in Asia and the Pacific. Human Development Report Unit. Colombo: UNDP Regional Centre. Available at www.undp.org/content/dam/ undp/library/corporate/HDR/Asia%20and%20Pacific%20HDR/RHDR\_Full%20 Report\_Tackling\_Corruption\_Transforming\_Lives.pdf.
  - . 2012. Seeing Beyond the State: Grassroots Women's Perspectives on Corruption and Anti-Corruption. New York: United Nations Development Programme. Available at www.undp.org/content/dam/undp/library/Democratic%20Governance/Anti-corruption/Grassroots%20women%20and%20anti-corruption.pdf.
- . 2014a. Género y Corrupción en América Latina: ¿Hay Alguna Conexion? Documento de Trabajo. Panama: UNDP Regional Center.

- 43
- . 2014b. Survey Methodology: Addressing Gender Equality Related Corruption Risks and Vulnerabilities in Civil Service. Bratislava: United Nations Development Programme Regional Centre for Europe and the Commonwealth of Independent States. Available at www.undp.md/media/tender\_supportdoc/2015/1103/ Survey\_Methodology-\_addressing\_gender\_equality\_related.pdf.
- UNDP and UNIFEM (United Nations Development Programme, United Nations Development Fund for Women). 2010. Corruption, Accountability and Gender: Understanding the Connections. Primers in Gender and Democratic Governance #5. New York: United Nations Development Programme, United Nations Development Fund for Women. Available at www.undp.org/ content/dam/aplaws/publication/en/publications/womens-empowerment/ corruption-accountability-and-gender-understanding-the-connection/ Corruption-accountability-and-gender.pdf.
- UNODC (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime). 2004. United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and the Protocols thereto. New York: United Nations. Available at www.unodc.org/documents/treaties/ UNTOC/Publications/TOC%20Convention/TOCebook-e.pdf.
- . 2016. Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2016. United Nations publication, Sales No. E.16.IV.6. Available at www.unodc.org/documents/dataand-analysis/glotip/2016\_Global\_Report\_on\_Trafficking\_in\_Persons.pdf.
- UN Women. 2012. Virtual Knowledge Centre to End Violence against Women and Girls: Strategies to Eliminate Corruption. (Online). Available at www. endvawnow.org/en/articles/1013-strategies-to-eliminate-corruption-.html.
- Vanderbilt University. 2010. AmericasBarometers. Latin American Public Opinion Project (Online). Available at www.vanderbilt.edu/lapop/ab2010.php.
- Vanderbilt University. 2012: Latin American Public Opinion Project. (Online). Nashville, Tenn.: Vanderbilt University. Available at www.vanderbilt.edu/ lapop/ab2012.php.
- Web Wide Web Foundation. 2008-2018. Women's Rights Online. Available at https://webfoundation.org/our-work/projects/womens-rights-online/.
- World Bank. 2012. The Effect of Women's Economic Power in Latin America and the Caribbean. Latin America and Caribbean Poverty and Labor Brief. Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at https://openknowledge.worldbank. org/bitstream/handle/10986/11867/9780821397701.pdf?sequence=1.
  - \_\_\_\_\_. 2014. Infographic: Global Index Finder 2014—Gender and Income. (Online). Washington, DC: World Bank. Available at www.worldbank.org/en/programs/ globalfindex/infographics/infographic-global-findex-2014-gender-income.

- WJP (World Justice Project). 2015. WJP Open Government Index 2015 at https:// worldjusticeproject.org/our-work/wjp-rule-law-index/wjp-open-governmentindex-2015.
- World Wide Web Foundation. 2008–2018. Women's Rights Online Digital Gender Gap Audit. Available at https://webfoundation.org/research/digital-gendergap-audit/.
- Zicherman, Nona. 2006. "It is difficult to escape what is linked to survival": Sexual Exploitation and Food Distribution in Burundi. Humanitarian Practice Network, November. Available at https://odihpn.org/magazine/%C2%91it-is-difficultto-escape-what-is-linked-to-survival%C2%92-sexual-exploitation-and-fooddistribution-in-burundi/.

